ABSTRACT

UNDERSTANDING CANADIAN RESPONSES TO HUMAN TRAFFICKING: A COMPARISON OF LOCAL COMMUNITY AND PROVINCIAL APPROACHES

Megan Byrne
September 2018

Advisor: M. Morton
Committee Member: V. Zawilski

In November of 2000, Canada proclaimed its commitment to prevent, suppress and punish those involved in the trafficking of persons. This research focuses on Canada-based inter-agency anti-trafficking coalitions who focus on responding to human trafficking. Data was collected in the form of a participant-observation study at a three-day conference held in South-western Ontario during the summer of 2015, where seven presentations were provided from four Ontario community coalitions and three provincial approaches from Western Canada regarding their approach to respond to human trafficking. A thematic analysis was conducted to examine each coalition’s approach in responding to human trafficking, with a particular focus on their work against sex trafficking. The secondary goal of this analysis was to compare the approaches used at the community versus provincial levels in Canada. The findings of this research demonstrate that through valued partnerships, Ontario community coalitions work to protect trafficking victims, prevent further instances of trafficking and prosecute traffickers. Lastly, this research demonstrated that community coalitions and provincial models are largely complimentary when responding to human trafficking. In addition to these findings, this research provides a conceptual framework for evaluating community and provincial anti-trafficking approaches to respond to human trafficking.
# Table of Contents

**Abstract** ................................................................................................................................. ii

**Chapter 1: Introduction** ........................................................................................................... 1

- Defining Human Trafficking ................................................................................................. 2
- Human Trafficking in Canada ............................................................................................... 5
- Purpose of Study ...................................................................................................................... 7
- Outline of Research Study ....................................................................................................... 9

**Chapter 2: Literature Review and Theoretical Framework** ................................................ 11

- Canadian Anti-Sex Trafficking Efforts .................................................................................. 12
- Responding to Sex Trafficking ............................................................................................... 14
- Victims of Sex Trafficking ...................................................................................................... 23
- Developing Community-Based Responses ............................................................................. 26
- Theoretical Framework ........................................................................................................... 31
- Feminist Criminology ............................................................................................................. 32
- Community Psychology .......................................................................................................... 38

**Chapter 3: Methodology** ....................................................................................................... 41

- Research Design .................................................................................................................... 42
- Thematic Analysis .................................................................................................................... 46
- Research Sit ............................................................................................................................. 47
- Data Collection ....................................................................................................................... 48
- Data Analysis ........................................................................................................................ 48
- Limitations of Research Design ............................................................................................. 50
- Researcher Reflexivity ........................................................................................................... 52
Chapter 4: Results........................................................................................................53
Ontario Coalition Findings..........................................................................................52
Ontario P1: Protection..................................................................................................52
Ontario P2: Prevention..................................................................................................57
Ontario P3: Prosecution..............................................................................................60
Ontario P4: Partnerships.............................................................................................63
Comparison of Ontario to Provincial Models.........................................................66

Chapter 5: Discussion..................................................................................................85
Examining Ontario Community Coalitions..............................................................85
Protecting Trafficking Victims..................................................................................88
Preventing Sex Trafficking.......................................................................................88
Prosecuting Traffickers.............................................................................................90
Building Partnerships...............................................................................................91
Conclusion................................................................................................................93
Limitations................................................................................................................97
Future Research........................................................................................................97

Reference List............................................................................................................99

Appendices..............................................................................................................112
Appendix A: Description of Response Models.......................................................120
Appendix B: The Codebook......................................................................................125
Appendix C: CATI Indicators that a Person is Experiencing Trafficking................122
Appendix D: Social Media Platforms.......................................................................130
Appendix E: Ontario Coalition Information Posters...............................................132
Appendix F: BC’s OCTIP Pocket Card…………………………………………………………136
Chapter 1: Introduction

In November of 2000, the United Nations ratified the *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons Especially Women and Children* (United Nations 2003). This protocol was created to supplement the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime in order to denounce and target human trafficking on a global scale (United Nations 2003). This *Protocol* is better known as the *Palermo Protocol*, since the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime was held in Palermo, Italy (Raymond 2001). This convention hosted delegates from 148 countries and of those countries, 80 countries signed the Protocol (United Nations 2003; Raymond 2001). Canada was included as one of these original 80 countries (United Nations 2003). This *Protocol* provided nations with an exact definition and understanding of human trafficking. As stated in the Protocol, trafficking in persons is defined as:

> the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs (United Nations 2003).

With this definition in mind, the *Protocol* was created with three main purposes.

These purposes are as follows:

a) To prevent and combat trafficking in persons, paying particular attention to women and children;

b) To protect and assist the victims of such trafficking, with full respect for their human rights; and

c) To promote cooperation among States Parties in order to meet those objectives
According to the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) (2012) human trafficking occurs in 161 countries around the world and generates an annual profit of $32 billion. This makes human trafficking the third largest criminal activity in the world in terms of profitability, falling only behind drug and arms trafficking (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime 2012; Bryfonski 2013).

**Defining Human Trafficking**

Human trafficking can be defined and categorized in many different ways (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime 2009; Winterdyk, Perrin and Reichel 2012). First there is the form of exploitation that a trafficking victim undergoes. As defined by the *Palermo Protocol* there are three forms of exploitation that dominate the majority of human trafficking incidents – sexual exploitation, forced labour, and trafficking for the purpose of organ removal trafficking (United Nations 2003a). Labour trafficking is defined as instances where a victim provides any service related to labour for no pay (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime 2016). Human trafficking for the purpose of organ removal involves a victim having one or more organs removed which a trafficker(s) then sells for profit (Cullen-DuPont 2009; United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime 2016). Sex trafficking involves an individual being forced into providing any form of sexual act through measures of coercion, manipulation or deceit (Winterdyk, Perrin and Reichel 2012; United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime 2016). According to the UNODC, sexual exploitation is the most commonly reported form of human trafficking as it accounts for 54% of the detected trafficking occurrences globally (2016, 28).
Another way in which human trafficking can be categorized is through the distinction of international and domestic trafficking (Winterdyk, Perrin and Reichel 2012; United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime 2016). International trafficking involves the victim crossing one or more nations’ border as a result of the exploitation they are undergoing, whereas domestic trafficking victims do not cross any national borders (Winterdyk, Perrin and Reichel 2012; United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime 2016). Domestic trafficking involves a victim being exploited only within the country for which they hold citizenship. According to the UNODC, approximately 42% of detected trafficking cases involve a victim being exploited within their country of citizenship (2016, 9). However, the UNODC (2016) states this number may be lower than the reality, as domestic trafficking can be more difficult to detect than international trafficking. This is due to the fact that domestic trafficking can be conducted with significantly less sophistication as compared to international trafficking. As an example, the UNODC (2014) points to a case where a trafficker in a small town of El Salvador exploiting one young girl is significantly more difficult to detect than a group of traffickers recruiting several women to traffic across borders where passports and other travel arrangements then become necessary.

Human trafficking does not always involve geographical movement of a victim (Kangaspunta 2004; United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime 2012; Winterdyk, Perrin and Reichel 2012; Royal Canadian Mounted Police 2014). The key part of human trafficking is the *exploitation* of the victim, not the physical movement of a victim across or within borders (Kangaspunta 2004; United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime 2012;
Winterdyk, Perrin and Reichel 2012; Royal Canadian Mounted Police 2014). Therefore, domestic trafficking does not even necessarily involve a victim moving between cities.

**Sex Work versus Sex Trafficking**

There is a growing debate among academics, activists and those involved in the sex trade regarding what acts can be defined as sex work versus sexual exploitation or sex trafficking (Batsyukova 2007; Spencer and Broad 2012; Cho 2013; Zawilski 2015). As explained by Batsyukova (2007), the one major distinction that separates sex work and human trafficking is the degree of choice to do sex work. In human trafficking, the individual is coerced, manipulated or forced into giving services relating to sex work, thereby making voluntary and/or informed consent nonexistent. However, some believe that voluntary consent to participate in sex work is an illusion (Spencer and Broad 2012; Zawilski 2015). This side of the debate sees sex work as inherently exploitive, with aspects of coercion, manipulation, etc. Consent is an important legal element. In Canada, this is included in the laws surrounding human trafficking. Even if an individual enters the sex trade voluntarily, the minute they wish to leave and are forced or coerced into continuing to deliver their services, they become a victim of human trafficking (Royal Canadian Mounted Police 2010). The second aspect that divides sex work and human trafficking is that a sex worker receives the money they are due for delivering their services (Batsyukova 2007; Spencer and Broad 2012; Cho 2013). A victim of human trafficking does not receive monetary compensation for their services – their traffickers do (Winterdyk, Perrin and Reichel 2012).
Human Trafficking in Canada

Canada was one of the 80 countries to ratify the Palermo Protocol, thereby officially proclaiming their commitment to meeting the purposes outlined in the Protocol to respond to human trafficking within Canada and on a global scale (United Nations 2003). This led to the creation of two key pieces of legislation in Canada. The first was introduced in 2002 as a provision under the Immigration and Refugee Protection Act (IRPA). Under section 118 of IRPA it is an offence to organize the recruitment and/or bringing of a person or persons into Canada through the use of abduction, fraud, deception or the use or threat of force or coercion for recruiting (Immigration and Refugee Protection Act 2002). The act further defines ‘organizing’ this event as including recruitment or transportation of the person or persons into the country and also the receipt or harbouring of those persons after their entry into Canada (Immigration and Refugee Protection Act 2002).

The second piece of legislation relating to human trafficking was the addition of section 279.01 to the Canadian Criminal Code in 2005 (Roots 2013). This section states that, “any person who recruits, transports, transfers, receives, holds, conceals or harbours a person, or exercises control, direction or influence over the movement of a person, for the purpose of exploiting them or facilitating their exploitation” is guilty of committing an indictable offence (Criminal Code of Canada 1985). Should an individual be convicted of this crime this individual is liable to:

a) imprisonment for life and to a minimum punishment of imprisonment for a term of five years if they kidnap, commit an aggravated assault or aggravated sexual assault against, or cause death to, the victim during the commission of the offence; or
b) imprisonment for a term of not more than 14 years and to a minimum punishment of imprisonment for a term of four years in any other case (Criminal Code of Canada 1985).

A victim under the age of 18 years (section 279.011) means that the individual guilty of committing the trafficking offence would be liable to the same punishments as outlined above, except in section a) they could be liable for a term of six years and in section b) the individual is liable for a minimum punishment of imprisonment for a term of five years as opposed to four years for a victim over the age of 18 (Criminal Code of Canada 1985).

To assess exploitation, the Criminal Code defines the threshold under section 279.04(1). Exploitation occurs when an individual engages in conduct that could reasonably be expected to cause the victim to believe their safety or the safety of a person known to them would be threatened if they fail to provide certain services the trafficker wished them to deliver (Criminal Code of Canada 1985). Section 279.04(2) states that in determining if exploitation has occurred, the court may consider whether the accused has used or threatened to use force or another form of coercion, used deception or abused a position of trust/power/authority in order to exploit a victim to provide certain services. Lastly, section 279.04(3) states that an individual exploits another person if they cause them to have an organ or tissue removed through the use of deception and/or threat or force/coercion (Criminal Code of Canada 1985).

Prevalence of Human Trafficking in Canada

The prevalence of human trafficking in any nation is difficult to identify because it is severely underreported (Sigmon 2008; Ali 2010; Barrett 2010). The Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP) (2017) reports 401 human trafficking cases, with 115
individuals receiving a conviction for human trafficking related offences across Canada as of January 2017. However, a study conducted by Gabriele et al. (2014) found 551 cases of human trafficking in Ontario alone in the time frame of January 1st 2011 to December 31st 2013. Clearly there remains a large gap in either the reporting of human trafficking crimes, a lack of ability to convict the traffickers, or a combination of both.

Canada has been identified as a source, transit and destination country for human trafficking (Royal Canadian Mounted Police 2014; U.S. Department of State 2017). The most common sources of internationally trafficked victims to Canada are countries in Asia, such as Thailand, Malaysia and Vietnam, and also from Eastern and Central Europe, from countries such as Poland and Hungary (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime 2009; Public Safety Canada 2012; U.S Department of State 2017). However, domestic trafficking, where Canadians are trafficked only within Canada, is significantly more common than international trafficking within Canada (Royal Canadian Mounted Police 2010; Public Safety Canada 2012). Additionally, similar to the international context of human trafficking, the most common form of exploitation victims experience is sexual exploitation (Royal Canadian Mounted Police 2010; Gabriele et al. 2014; Public Safety Canada 2012). The vast majority of instances of human trafficking discovered in Canada were Canadian women and children being trafficked for the purpose of sexual exploitation (Royal Canadian Mounted Police 2010; Public Safety Canada 2014).

Purpose of Study

The purpose of this study is to understand, compare and analyze various approaches to responding to human trafficking, with a specific focus on sex trafficking, as it is the most common form of human trafficking in Canada. Limited academic
research exists looking at approaches used to respond to any form of human trafficking in Canada (Quarterman, Kaye and Winterdyk 2012). This study aims to add to this body of research, and the larger discourse on human trafficking. More specifically, this study will compare various counter-human trafficking approaches that are currently employed across the country. In certain regions of Canada, such as Alberta and British Columbia, provincial approaches exist where the entire province works together in a coalition format with inter-agency cooperation (Action Coalition on Human Trafficking 2012; Office to Combat Trafficking in Persons 2014). A provincial approach does not currently exist in Ontario. Instead, community level approaches exist throughout Ontario (Toronto Counter Human Trafficking Network 2013; Ottawa Coalition to End Human Trafficking 2015).

This study compares the two types of approaches to understand where the differences/similarities exist when comparing larger provincial models to smaller, community approaches, with a particular focus on their response to sex trafficking. This analysis also demonstrates where gaps between the two approaches exist.

There are two main theoretical frameworks that have guided this study and offer an integrated theoretical analysis. The first is feminist criminology and the second is community psychology. A feminist criminology framework helps to explain the experience of women as victims of crime and gendered violence (Comack 1999; Chesney-Lind and Morash 2013). It emphasizes differences based on race or culture/ethnicity, gender and other individual variables that may influence a person’s lived experiences, as well as any personal history that could lead a woman to become a victim of a violent crime (Chesney-Lind and Morash 2013). The community psychology framework presents a multi-dimensional structure that has many approaches that work
toward helping disempowered individuals take control of their lives through the use of social systems (Levine et al. 2005; Boyd 2014). Therefore, this framework helps to explain the ways in which a community or group of individuals/organizations work together in order to accomplish one common goal – in this case the goal of responding to human trafficking within a given jurisdiction. With this in mind, there are two main research questions guiding this study:

1. What are the anti-sex trafficking approaches in Ontario communities?
2. How do these Ontario community responses to human trafficking differ from provincial approaches in Canada?

The following section provides details on the chapters comprising the current research study.

**Outline of Research Study**

Chapter two provides a literature review on responses to sex trafficking. Unfortunately, there has not been a significant amount of focus in academia on sex trafficking in Canada. Therefore, this chapter also includes responses used in other Western nations, mainly from the United States and the United Kingdom, as more research exists focusing on trafficking in these nations. An integrated theoretical framework is presented in this chapter combining feminist criminology and community psychology to offer an understanding on how a community-based approach in the form of inter-agency cooperation can respond to a gendered crime such as sex trafficking.

Chapter three introduces the methodological framework used in this research to study various approaches used throughout Canada to respond to sex trafficking in a given jurisdiction. This chapter details the research process. It outlines the data collection
process and the subsequent analysis of the data in the form of the qualitative method of thematic analysis.

Chapter four presents the findings of the thematic analysis. Findings are presented in the form of four overarching themes. These four themes were discovered naturally during the data collection process and collectively demonstrate how the various approaches, both municipal and provincial, work to address sex trafficking. Overall these four themes directly answer the two research questions guiding this study.

Chapter five links the findings discussed in chapter four with the previous academic literature and theoretical framework presented in chapter two. Implications of the results of this study and the link to previous research done in this field are also presented in this chapter. Following this, limitations and directions for future research are offered in the concluding portion of this study.
Chapter 2: Literature Review and Theoretical Framework

Human trafficking is a crime that affects the vast majority of countries worldwide (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime 2012; Winterdyk, Perrin and Reichel 2012). It produces a profit for the trafficker(s) that makes it an extremely lucrative criminal activity (Logan, Walker and Hunt 2009; Walker 2013; Hodge 2014; Hopper 2017). Human trafficking involves coercing, manipulating, controlling and ultimately exploiting a person for the purpose of monetary gain (Ali 2010; Winterdyk, Perrin and Reichel 2012). Annually, the United States Department of State releases a report on Trafficking in Persons (TIP) that highlights different countries’ attempts to combat human trafficking, and provides recommendations for improvement. Canada has met some of these recommendations; however, according to the 2017 TIP report, Canada is failing to respond to human trafficking in several areas (U.S. Department of State 2017).

This chapter will examine research on human trafficking, with a particular focus on sex trafficking in a Canadian context. Existing literature will be discussed that looks at sex trafficking and various responses to combatting the crime and helping trafficking victims. There is minimal research looking at community responses to sex trafficking in Canada; however, two main studies give a general outline of human trafficking in Ontario and in major cities throughout the country. Because of the dearth of literature on community responses to sex trafficking and the attention on community responses to other crimes involving violence against women, such as intimate partner violence and sexual assault, this literature will be reviewed. Ultimately, the focus of this portion of the chapter will examine the value of an inter-agency coalition to respond to a social and political social problem like sex trafficking.
Canadian Anti-Sex Trafficking Efforts

To effectively respond to sex trafficking there are two main parts of the crime that must be considered – stopping the traffickers and helping the victims escape from exploitation (Oxman-Martinez, Hanley and Lacroix 2005; Public Safety Canada 2016). The Canadian government put together a Human Trafficking Taskforce (the Taskforce) led by Public Safety Canada and comprised of several key governmental departments, such as Canada Border Services Agency, Royal Canadian Mounted Police, Immigration, Refugees and Citizenship Canada, Indigenous and Northern Affairs Canada, and the Status of Women Canada, to name a few. The aim of the Taskforce is to implement the National Action Plan created by Public Safety Canada to combat and respond to human trafficking in Canada. This National Action Plan focuses on four pillars (known as the 4 Ps) that have been internationally recognized as four key elements in responding to human trafficking: prevention, protection, prosecution, and partnerships (Public Safety Canada 2012). At the end of each year, Public Safety Canada releases a report discussing how the Taskforce accomplished implementing the National Action Plan within Canada with respect to preventing the crime, prosecuting those committing the crime, protecting victims, and facilitating partnerships among departments/agencies/individuals (Public Safety Canada 2016).

Similar to this National Action Plan is the aforementioned annual United States TIP report. This report focuses on individual nations’ efforts to respond to human trafficking and offers recommendations in areas to improve for three of the 4 Ps discussed above – that being prevention, protection and prosecution. Noticeably the fourth P (partnerships) is absent from this report, however, what is highlighted is
Canada’s need to strengthen relationships between law enforcement officials and service providers, increase interagency communication, and for the government to work in conjunction with its civil partners (U.S Department of State 2017). When examining the explanation above from Public Safety Canada (2012) on the fourth P of partnerships, many similarities exist between their definition and suggestions put forward by the TIP report. Therefore, one can conclude the TIP report does value partnerships as a legitimate means in responding to human trafficking without explicitly referring to it as one of the four pillars.

In addition to these initiatives implemented by the Canadian government, limited research specific to Canadian responses to human trafficking is available to understand exactly what responses exist in Canada beyond the federal level. For example, there was a study conducted by the Alliance Against Modern Slavery based out of York region in Ontario that examined human trafficking in Ontario from 2011-2013 (Gabriele et al. 2014). This study found 551 cases of individuals being trafficked in Ontario either as a destination, source or transit point (Gabriele et al. 2014, 9). Moreover, it found sexual exploitation to be the most common form of trafficking occurring in Ontario (Gabriele et al. 2014). The gender breakdown in victims was approximately 90.2% female and 9.1% male (Gabriele et al. 2014, 16). The remaining victims’ gender in the study was not available. The average age range of trafficking victims was between 15 and 24 years (Gabriele et al. 2014, 16). The majority of those trafficked were trafficked domestically within Canada (62.2%) (Gabriele et al. 2014, 20). The two major conclusions drawn from this report were the need for a province-wide taskforce to combat human trafficking in Ontario, and the need for more preventive measures to be introduced.
Another study conducted by Oxman-Martinez, Hanley and Lacroix (2005) on behalf of the Canadian federal Department of Justice looked at municipal responses to human trafficking across Canada. The focus of this research was from the perspective of service providers in major Canadian cities. They found that service providers across the country stressed the need for more funding and for a larger focus on preventative measures. Moreover, this research found systemic barriers to communication. In particular, Oxman-Martinez, Hanley and Lacroix state there is a “wide gap in communication between NGOs and government policy decision-makers. Efforts could be made to improve communication with community groups…” (2005, 30). By way of example, Oxman-Martinez, Hanley and Lacroix (2005) state that the Canadian government could more effectively communicate their federal goals as it pertains to human trafficking, as currently the community groups do not feel there is an effective, consistent manner of understanding the vision or goals to be strived for from the point of view of the Government of Canada. This is, perhaps, where research on community coalitions in Canada could be useful.

The next section of this chapter will examine the efforts and/or strategies that are needed to eradicate sex trafficking. Due to the limited amount of Canadian research on sex trafficking, research focusing on Western countries will be examined.

**Responding to Sex Trafficking**

An effective response to sex trafficking includes prevention. The main goal of any response to human trafficking should be the complete eradication of this crime (Chuang 2005; Canada Women’s Foundation 2013; Karlsson 2013). Before examining best
prevention strategies, it is first important to understand how victims are recruited into the trafficking world.

**Prevention**

**Understanding Recruitment Techniques**

A major component of human trafficking is the initial recruitment of a victim by a trafficker. This individual is often specifically targeted due to certain characteristics about their life (Sigmon 2008; Bryfonski 2013; Task Force on Trafficking of Women and Girls 2014; Public Safety Canada 2012). Those conducting the recruitment can sometimes be strangers, but more often it involves someone known to the victim, such as a family member or friend (Oxman-Martinez, Lacroix and Hanley 2005; Sigmon 2008; Di Tomasso et al. 2009; Reynolds 2011; Gabriel et al. 2014; Beeson 2015). The recruitment process begins with a trafficker grooming the individual they wish to recruit. As stated by Beeson,

> The grooming process is a manipulative psychological process designed to capitalize on a potential victim’s vulnerabilities to manipulate them into participating in the activities of the organization … the trafficker uses both positive and negative reinforcement to condition a victim into “willingly” participating (2015, 50).

Within the existing literature on recruitment techniques, there is common reference to what has been deemed by some as the “love” or “love bombing” approach (Kennedy et al. 2007; Wilson and Dalton 2008; Dorias and Corriveau 2009; Kotrala 2010; Walker 2013; Hammond and McGlone 2014; Beeson 2015; Department of Justice 2015; Meshkovska et al. 2015; Louie 2017; Sprang and Cole 2018). This approach involves the trafficker acting as the boyfriend/girlfriend/lover/partner to a potential victim and overwhelming them with love and affection. Thereafter, the trafficker isolates the victim
and creates a sense of dependency on the trafficker in order to fully recruit them into delivering sexual services (Canada Women’s Foundation 2013; Task Force on Trafficking of Women and Girls 2014; Beeson 2015; Department of Justice 2015; Meshkovska et al. 2015; Verhoeven et al. 2015).

Second to the love approach is the recruitment technique of a trafficker offering paid work to their intended victim, often under the pre-text of something other than sex work. However, through various means, the victim is eventually forced into sex work (Hughes 2000; Hodge 2008; Crawford and Kaufman 2008; Di Tomasso et al. 2009; Jones et al. 2011; Vindhya and Dev 2011; Task Force on Trafficking of Women and Girls 2014; Crawford 2017). One means by which the trafficker forces the victim into sex work is through what has been referred to as the “debt” approach, wherein the trafficker will provide items such as food, clothing, money, protection, etc., depending on the targeted victim’s needs (Oxman-Martinez, Lacroix and Hanley 2005; Kennedy et al. 2007; Wilson and Dalton 2008; Logan, Walker and Hunt 2009; Loring et al. 2011; Beeson 2015; Crawford 2017). These gifts are given with the impression that they are free, however once the gifts are accepted the trafficker then insists the victim is indebted to them and must deliver sexual services to pay off this debt (Hughes 2000; Oxman-Martinez, Lacroix and Hanley 2005; Jones et al. 2011; Beeson 2015). This gift could also be given in the form of an addictive drug, thereby causing the victim to become physically or psychologically dependent on the substance. The trafficker then uses this addiction to coerce the victim into providing sexual services to clients in exchange for drugs (Kennedy et al 2007; Kotrala 2010; Hammond and McGlone 2014; Beeson 2015; Department of Justice 2015; Roberson 2017; Sprang and Cole 2018).
One other recruitment technique identified in the literature is the use of violence (Kennedy et al. 2007; Hodge 2008; Logan, Hunt and Walker 2009; Walker 2013; Hammond and McGlone 2014; Beeson 2015; Crawford 2017). Violent approaches to recruiting a victim include the use of physical violence to scare and/or force a victim into providing services. There is also research that demonstrates kidnapping is used as a form of recruitment (Hughes 2000; Hodge 2008; Wilson and Dalton 2008; Sigmon 2008; Di Tomasso et al. 2009; Logan, Walker and Hunt 2009; Reynolds 2011; Walker 2013). As explained by Beeson, the trafficker using a violent approach will use “beatings, rape, threats of abuse, threat to family or loved ones, kidnapping, and other brutal means to gain domination of a victim” (2005, 51).

Overall, recruitment and grooming techniques involve the trafficker making deceptive promises and manipulating their targeted victim. Thereafter, the victim finds themselves in an endless cycle of manipulation, deception, abuse, and exploitation. Now, with this understanding of the recruitment techniques employed, existing academic literature on prevention strategies relating to trafficking in persons will be presented.

**Prevention Strategies**

To prevent sex trafficking, coalitions must attempt to prevent a victim from being recruited by a trafficker (Chaung 2005; Samarasinghe and Burton 2007; Task Force on Trafficking of Women and Girls 2014; Wilson, Critelli and Rittner 2015). There are several potential methods to accomplish this goal, however existing literature demonstrates a trend toward two specific methods that work best in preventing sex trafficking. The first is to raise awareness and provide education about sex trafficking (Mameli 2002; Samarasinghe and Burton 2007; Reynolds 2011; Task Force on
Trafficking of Women and Girls 2014; Public Safety Canada 2012). The second is to address the vulnerabilities that make an individual susceptible to sex trafficking (Samarasinghe and Burton 2007; Barrett 2010; Brown 2011; Task Force on Trafficking of Women and Girls 2014). Each of these methods will be discussed in more depth below.

**Awareness-Raising and Education**

Public Safety Canada’s National Action Plan (2012) focuses on a prevention strategy that aims to raise awareness and educate the public about human trafficking in Canada. There are two main components. First is raising awareness about indicators of sex trafficking so the general public is better able to identify it as it is happening, or before a victim is recruited. The second is raising awareness and/or providing education to those specifically at-risk to becoming victims of sex trafficking.

Raising awareness about a crime that is inherently misunderstood is one of the necessary steps that must be taken to fully prevent sex trafficking from occurring (Samarasinghe and Burton 2007; Sigmon 2008; Walker 2013; Karlsson 2013; Task Force on Trafficking of Women and Girls 2014). As outlined in chapter one, sex work and sex trafficking are often conflated. It is therefore necessary for prevention strategies to educate the public on the essential component of consent within these two fields. Prevention strategies should focus on informing Canadians of the harm involved in the sex trafficking world. As stated by Mameli,

> awareness campaigns that not only point out the human rights violations associated with forced sex work via trafficking, but that also key on criminal penalties and the potential for transmission of diseases such as HIV/AIDS, are essential elements in fortifying a framework for disrupting the desire of a population for this commodity (2002, 74).
Existing research on preventing sex trafficking posits that those indulging in the purchasing of trafficking victims’ services must better understand not only the potential harm to the victim they are purchasing, but also to themselves (Mameli 2002; Canada Women’s Foundation 2013; Walker 2013; Karlsson 2013; Wilson, Critelli and Rittner 2015). It is also essential for the purchaser of these services to learn the indicators for themselves to differentiate between sex work and sex trafficking so as not to feed the latter accidentally.

Another reason for providing education and raising awareness about sex trafficking is to increase the detection of this crime. As previously discussed, sex trafficking is a severely underreported crime in Canada (Barrett 2013; Walker 2013; Gabriele et al. 2014; Public Safety Canada 2012). To prevent sex trafficking from occurring it must be brought out of the shadows in society. As explained by Sigmon (2008) and Karlsson (2013), as awareness on a given crime grows, so too does detection of the crime. This in turn leads to more arrests, and less occurrences of the crime. It is therefore essential for any prevention strategy to include educating individuals in Canada on sex trafficking. In particular, it is important to raise awareness and educate those deemed at-risk that they may become a victim of sex trafficking (Oxman-Martinez, Lacroix and Hanley 2005; Samarasinghe and Burton 2007; Beeson 2015; Public Safety Canada 2016).

**Targeting Vulnerabilities**

When considering the vulnerabilities that lend to an individual being targeted for sex trafficking recruitment, adopting an intersectional approach is key. To adopt an intersectional lens is to examine an individual at the intersection of their various
identities, with a particular focus on race or ethnicity, gender and class (Anthias and Yuval-Davis 1983; Crenshaw 1999; Berger and Guidroz 2009; Henne and Troshnyski 2013). This intersectional lens is necessary as existing research on sex trafficking demonstrates that the three main vulnerabilities to becoming a trafficking victim are: (1) being of a marginalized ethno-racial background (Chuang 2006; Oxman-Martinez, Lacroix and Hanley 2005; Samarasinghe and Burton 2007; Hammond and McGlone 2014; Public Safety Canada 2016; Crawford 2017); (2) being impoverished (Chaung 2005; Cullen-Dupont, Neuwirth and Bien-Aime 2009; Walker 2013; Barrett 2013); and (3) being female (Cullen-Dupont, Neuwirth and Bien-Aime 2009; Barrett 2010; Crawford 2017). In Canada, this is a particularly prevalent problem, as First Nations women are disproportionately represented among sex trafficking victims (Oxman-Martinez, Lacroix and Hanley 2005; Barrett 2010, 2013; McIntyre 2012; Public Safety Canada 2016; Louie 2017). Not only do First Nations people typically live in communities that are in less affluent parts of Canada, but First Nations women and girls are also the most at-risk to being trafficked within the First Nations community (Oxman-Martinez, Lacroix and Hanley 2005; Samarasinghe and Burton 2007; McIntyre 2012; Canada Women’s Foundation 2013). One can therefore only understand the particular susceptibility of First Nations people in becoming victims of sex trafficking by adopting an intersectional lens. With this, existing sex trafficking research posits that prevention strategies should focus on diminishing or eliminating these typical vulnerabilities (Chuang 2006; Samarasinghe and Burton 2007; Cullen-Dupont, Neuwirth and Bien-Aime 2009; Crawford 2017).

Prosecuting Traffickers
Attention on prosecuting those responsible for trafficking has increased (Brown 2011; Public Safety Canada 2012; van der Watt and van der Westhuizen 2017). One obvious method to address trafficking discussed widely in the existing literature is through the prosecution of these criminals (Wilson and Dalton 2008; Logan Hunt and Walker 2009; Reynolds 2011; Karlsson 2013; DiRienzo and Das 2017). As discussed previously, the Canadian government developed legislation specifically targeting human trafficking in both immigration and criminal law to convict human traffickers. Since enacting this legislation the Royal Canadian Mounted Police reports 401 human trafficking cases occurring across Canada, with 115 individuals receiving a conviction for human trafficking related offences as of January 2017 (2017, 1).

One of the major challenges with prosecuting traffickers is the difficulty in detecting cases of sex trafficking (Sigmon 2008; Barrett 2010; Verhoeven and Gestel 2011; Karlsson 2013; Gabriele et al. 2014; Hammond and McGlone 2014; Task Force on Trafficking of Women and Girls 2014; Department of Justice 2015; Roberson 2017). Naturally the trafficker does everything they can to conceal sex trafficking, and adding to this difficulty is that victims can also wish to keep their exploitation a secret. This is mainly due to the victim’s fear for their own safety and/or their families/loved ones’ safety, which can be threatened should the victim ever attempt to stray from their trafficker (Sigmon 2008; Logan, Hunt and Walker 2009; Barrett 2010; Brown 2011; Canada Women’s Foundation 2013; Hammond and McGlone 2014; van der Watt and van der Westhuizen 2017). There is also the fear and/or mistrust of the police and other authorities (Sigmon 2008; Barrett 2010; Canada Women’s Foundation 2013; Karlsson 2013; Task Force on Trafficking of Women and Girls 2014; Department of Justice 2015).
This fear is often a result of the stigmatization attached to sex workers, even in the case of a sex trafficking victim who was not a willing participating in the industry (Oxman-Martinez, Hanley and Lacroix 2005; Sigmon 2008; Brown 2011). This fear is often re-enforced by the trafficker, who will manipulate the victim into believing that the police are an enemy rather than someone to help them (Oxman-Martinez, Hanley and Lacroix 2005; Brown 2011; Task Force on Trafficking of Women and Girls 2014). This is particularly true for international victims who may not only fear facing this stigma but also fear deportation, or else they may be used to the police/authorities in their home country being corrupt/untrustworthy (Oxman-Martinez, Hanley and Lacroix 2005; Sigmon 2008; Barrett 2010; Canada Women’s Foundation 2013; Task Force on Trafficking of Women and Girls 2014).

Even when a victim does come forward or is discovered, prosecuting a trafficker or several traffickers involved in their case can be a particularly challenging task (Barrett 2010; Brown 2011; Department of Justice 2015; Peters 2015; van der Watt and van der Westhuizen 2017). As discussed above, there are issues with the fear a victim feels toward their trafficker and/or police and other authorities involved in a criminal case. This leads not only to difficulty in detecting cases to bring forward for prosecution, but also makes it unlikely that even if a victim is detected, they will be a willing participant in the criminal justice process (Sigmon 2008; Barrett 2010; Brown 2011; Department of Justice 2015; Peters 2015). This is due in large part to the fears outlined above; however, there is also the issue of the victim having to act as a witness and face their trafficker in court where they would then be asked to openly discuss their traumatic experiences (Sigmon 2008; Barrett 2010; Peters 2015).
Another challenge in prosecuting sex trafficking cases is the issue of victims not wanting to go against their trafficker due to their feelings toward him or her. It is not always the case that the victim fully grasps that they are a sex trafficking victim, and are so heavily manipulated by their trafficker that they have genuine loving feelings toward him or her (Sigmon 2008; Barrett 2010; Kotrala 2010; Verhoeven and Gestel 2011; Canada Women’s Foundation 2013; Department of Justice 2015; Orme and Ross-Sheriff 2015; Peters 2015). This, in combination with the issues discussed above, often leads to victims being unwilling to act as a witness in their trafficker’s trial. Unfortunately, research demonstrates that without the victim acting as a willing witness in a trial, the prosecution will have a very difficult time proving the crime occurred (Brown 2011; Verhoeven and Gestel 2011; Department of Justice 2015; Peters 2015). This demonstrates the vital role a victim plays in prosecuting sex trafficking.

**Victims of Sex Trafficking**

Given the underreported nature of human trafficking, it is difficult to accurately identify human trafficking victims’ demographics. Still, as previously discussed, research suggests that females make up the vast majority of human trafficking victims, particularly in sex trafficking (Bryfonski 2013; Public Safety Canada 2012; United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime 2014; Beeson 2015; Crawford 2017). Moreover, research has demonstrated that victims’ face some common needs and challenges upon their escape from their trafficker(s). The main focus of this section will be on service providers, particularly those in the social services sector, and how they can help to protect, heal and reintegrate trafficking victims after their exploitation has ceased. Research will also be presented on the best approach to deliver these services to a sex trafficking victim.
Responding to Trafficking Victims

Existing research on the needs of trafficking victims posits that trafficking victims typically exhibit both immediate and long-term needs. Of these needs, the need for appropriate shelter is often discussed as the most crucial aspect for service providers to concentrate on (Oxman-Martinez, Lacroix and Hanley 2005; Logan, Hunt and Walker 2009; Kotrala 2010; Macy and Johns 2011; Hammond and McGlone 2014; Wilson, Critelli and Rittner 2015). Without the feeling of being completely protected from their trafficker(s), many victims will attempt to flee or return to their trafficker for fear of eventual reprisal for leaving. Additionally, existing research demonstrates that trafficking victims will likely exhibit emergency medical needs that will need to be treated on an imminent basis (Office for Victims of Crime 2014; Hardy, Compton and McPhatter 2013; Hodge 2014). This is particularly true for sex trafficking victims, as emergency medical care for these victims can include rape testing kits or allocating necessary medication.

Trafficking victims also have long-term needs (Logan, Hunt and Walker 2009; Macy and Johns 2011; Hammond and McGlone 2014; Hodge 2014; Office for Victims of Crime 2014). Existing research demonstrates that these needs typically include testing for diseases, such as sexually transmitted diseases and HIV/AIDS and to contact law enforcement officials to discuss the criminal case against the trafficker, should one exist (Logan, Hunt and Walker 2009; Hammond and McGlone 2014; Office for Victims of Crime 2014; Crawford 2017). However, the most important aspect for service providers to consider in treating trafficking victims on a long-term basis is their mental health (Logan, Hunt and Walker 2009; Macy and Johns 2011; Canada Women’s Foundation
As stated by Hodge:

the restoration of psychological wellness is critical. If the psychological wounds inflicted by traffickers are left unaddressed, then the likelihood of revictimization increases substantially. Victims must work through the psychological challenges to avoid becoming ensnared by traffickers again and to move toward a productive life (2014, 115)

 Trafficking victims face many mental health struggles after being trafficked that naturally vary depending on the person. Previous research has found that typically these victims deal with such issues as depression, posttraumatic stress disorder (PTSD), anxiety, loss of self-esteem, extreme forms of submissiveness, self-harm, feelings of shame and guilt, and suicidal ideation/tendencies (Yen 2008; Jones 2009; Hardy, Compton and McPhatter 2013; Walker 2013; Hodge 2014; Beeson 2015; Crawford 2017; Hopper 2017; Sprang and Cole 2018).

When delivering services to a trafficking victim, there is a general consensus among government officials, service providers and academics that a combination of a trauma-informed and victim-centred approach is best (Weissbecker and Clark 2007; Jones 2009; Macy and Johns 2011; Gabriele et al. 2014; Hodge 2014; Office for Victims of Crime 2014; Orme and Ross-Sheriff 2015; Wilson, Critelli and Rittner 2015; Hopper 2017). No matter what form of sexual exploitation a victim has experienced there is often some form of trauma involved. As a result, it is essential that service providers or anyone attempting to help a trafficking victim understand trauma and how it can influence a victim and their behaviour/needs (Weissbecker and Clark 2007; Macy and Johns 2011; Hardy, Compton and McPhatter 2013; Hodge 2014; Hammond and McGlone 2014; Sapiro et al. 2016; Hopper 2017).
Victim-centered approaches are also advocated widely (Gabriele et al. 2014; Hodge 2014; Orme and Ross-Sheriff 2015; Wilson, Critelli and Rittner 2015). Encompassed in a victim-centred approach is ensuring that the individual needs of a trafficking victim are recognized and met no matter how unique they may be (Hodge 2014; Orme and Ross-Sheriff 2015). While there may be certain commonalities between victims, ultimately individuals and their experiences will vary and it is important that service providers make available to victims a variety of services. It is with this approach, coupled with maintaining a focus on how trauma can affect an individual that will allow a service provider to most effectively help a victim of sex trafficking.

Developing Community-Based Responses

In this section, the main focus has been placed upon international and/or federal research in responding to sex trafficking. However, the remainder of this section will focus on the main subject of this study, community-based coalitions. Community-based coalitions involve multiple organizations/agencies from various sectors in a given jurisdiction working together to respond to sex trafficking effectively (Sigmon 2008; Orme and Ross-Sheriff 2015; Peters 2015; Wilson, Critelli and Rittner 2015; Roberson 2017). The writer notes there are many ways to define these community-based coalitions, however for the purposes of this research, they will be referred to as community coalitions. A community coalition will be defined by adopting the definition created by the Toronto Counter Human Trafficking Network (2013), as it encompasses a well-defined explanation of the structure and actions of community coalitions responding to human trafficking. Specifically, it states that the community coalition is a comprehensive response to human trafficking … provided in a collaborative manner with governmental and non-governmental organizations, agencies
and individuals. These partners shall be committed to work towards the elimination of the crime of human trafficking, while facilitating services and protection to a trafficked person (Toronto Countering Human Trafficking Network 2013, 1).

Community coalitions can include governmental and non-governmental organizations, and commonly include the police, social service providers, members of the legal system, government representatives, health care systems, and educational and vocational programs (Sigmon 2008; Allen, Watt and Hess 2008; Shorey, Tirone and Stuart 2014; Orme and Ross-Sheriff 2015; Peters 2015; Roberson 2017).

No academic research to date has examined Ontario community coalitions and their response to human trafficking. However, when looking across Canada, there was one study conducted by Quarterman, Kaye and Winterdyk (2012) in Calgary, Alberta regarding a community coalition entitled the Action Coalition on Human Trafficking. The main purpose of this research was to better understand how the community coalition was responding to human trafficking and assisting victims in Calgary (Quarterman, Kaye and Winterdyk 2012). The study produced recommendations to improve the community coalition, the first of which was to use a victim-centred service delivery (Quarterman, Kaye and Winterdyk 2012). Another main recommendation was to increase specialized training for all social services and criminal justice officials that may come into contact with trafficking victims. This is not only to help the healing process of trafficking victims, but also to increase the likelihood of pursuing prosecutions. As stated by Quarterman, Kaye and Winterdyk:

law enforcement officials have the responsibility of investigating cases of suspected human trafficking and to do so effectively, require specialist knowledge on investigative techniques to gather intelligence while simultaneously protecting the rights of victims of trafficking (2012, 35).
One other recommendation provided in this study was to raise awareness/educate the public about human trafficking. In particular, Quarterman, Kaye and Winterdyk state that it is essential that any strategies focusing on raising awareness/educating the public about human trafficking must have a “pro-active approach” with the focus being preventing further instances of trafficking, as opposed to simply spreading awareness that human trafficking exists (2012, 37).

While there is only limited research examining the success of these approaches, research does exist that looks at these types of responses to violence against women, victims of violent crimes, and other social problems. Community coalitions are adopted to mobilize change in a community because they bring together diverse stakeholders that share a common goal (Foster-Fishman et al. 2001; Reed, Miller and Fransico 2014; Arthur et al. 2010; Sigmon 2008 and Peters 2015). The next portion of this chapter will discuss research examining community coalitions and their responses to various health and social issues.

**Community Coalitions Against Health- and Social-Related Issues**

Examples of community coalitions attending to important health matters include coalitions formed to respond to diseases such HIV/AIDS (Chutuape et al. 2010; Lapierriere 2013; Reed et al. 2014), and hepatitis (Trinh-Shevrin et al. 2011; Bailey et al. 2011; Cohen et al. 2013). Trinh-Shevrin et al. (2011) maintain that community coalitions are an important approach to consider when responding to health-related matters because they provide an opportunity to bring together various experts, perspectives, and resources to develop a response in a given community. This includes providing the individuals with education on the topic, raising awareness about the disease, and/or directing individuals
where to receive services to treat their health-related issues (Trinh-Shevrin et al. 2011; Bailey et al. 2011; Reed et al. 2014). Many of these coalitions also focus on how to prevent the spread of their targeted health matters (Chutuape et al. 2010; Trinh-Shevrin et al. 2011; Reed et al. 2014).

Community coalitions also exist to respond to important social issues such as youth related crimes (Arthur et al. 2010; Hernandez-Cordero et al. 2011; Wunrow and Einspruch 2001), sexual assault (Smith, Hlmseth, Macgregor and Letourneau 1998; Campbell, Patterson and Bybee 2011; Greeson and Campbell 2015) and intimate partner violence (IPV) (Brackley et al. 2003; Shabnam and Allen 2011; Hazan et al. 2013). For the purpose of this research, the coalitions relating to IPV and sexual assault (SA) will receive the main focus, as they are most closely related to the subject of sex trafficking with both areas focusing on violence against women.

Community coalitions that work to respond to and/or combat IPV and SA are successful in three major areas. The first is facilitating relationships between partners within the coalition and outside of the coalition (Foster-Fishman et al. 2001; Robinson 2006; Allen, Watt and Hess 2008, Javdani and Allen 2011; Shorey, Tirone and Stuart 2014; Greeson and Campbell 2015; McCoy et al. 2017). When a coalition begins working together, relationships will foster between members. With these relationships comes a more natural flow of services being delivered to a victim and/or with criminal justice authorities to aid the prosecution of an offender (Shorey, Tirone and Stuart 2014; Greeson and Campbell 2015).

Secondly, IPV and SA coalitions are successful in promoting knowledge (Lasker and Weiss 2003; Allen, Watt and Hess 2008; Allen et al. 2012). These coalitions bring
together organizations that have various foci on a given issue within and/or across fields (Foster-Fisman et al. 2001; Shorey, Tirone and Stuart 2014). For example, within the social services sector there may be stakeholders who specifically focus on housing women who have left their abusive partners, and those that focus on substance abuse issues. On their own, these two services will likely not provide all the services needed by victims of IPV. A community coalition seeks to rectify this by creating one cohesive, multi-faceted team working together to deliver these services to an individual victim. The coalition acts as a guide between the many services that a victim often needs, such as medical, legal or social services (Robinson 2006; Shorey, Tirone and Stuart 2014; Greeson and Campbell 2015). Moreover, by mobilizing knowledge within their coalitions, members become more aware of their partners’ capabilities when responding to IPV and/or SA. This in turn provides agencies/organizations with a better understanding about the system as a whole, which allows community coalitions to appreciate where the gaps exist (Allen, Watt and Hess 2008). With this knowledge, partners can begin to repair these gaps where victims and/or offenders may fall through.

The third success demonstrated by community coalitions is in creating institutionalized change (Salzar et al. 2007; Allen, Watt and Hess 2008; Javdani and Allen 2011; McCoy et al. 2017). Institutionalized change is defined as any change demonstrated in either the victim’s experience or the prosecution or prevention of the specific crime being focused on (Sullivan and Bybee 1999; Allen, Watt and Hess 2008; McCoy et al 2017). An example of this can be seen in Sullivan and Bybee’s (1999) study where they found that victims of IPV who met with an advocate from a community coalition were significantly less likely to return to their abuser and subsequently
experienced less abuse than those in the study that did not communicate with a community coalition. Institutionalized change was also found when Campbell, Patterson and Bybee (2011) conducted a case study on a coalition comprising of mainly nurses who received special training in caring for and gathering evidence from SA victims. Campbell, Patterson and Bybee (2011) report prosecutions of SA rising within the jurisdiction of the coalition as a direct result of this coalition’s work.

The ultimate goal of creating institutionalized change in the way that IPV and SA coalitions have done was successful because it was facilitated through relationships built between members of various agencies/organizations working together as a cohesive unit that focuses on mobilizing knowledge/information (Foster-Fishman et al. 2001; Allen, Watt and Hess 2008; Campbell, Patterson and Bybee 2011). In the context of this study, community coalitions designed to respond to sex trafficking can be as successful as those addressing IPV and SA. In the following section, two theories will be presented as an integrated theoretical framework that will be used to analyze the community coalitions involved in this study.

**Theoretical Framework**

For the purposes of this research, the theoretical framework will draw on the theories of feminist criminology and community psychology. This section of the chapter will begin with an introduction to feminism and feminist criminology theory. It will then use a feminist criminology lens to examine sex trafficking and more specifically, community responses to sex trafficking. Thereafter a community psychology lens will be introduced to help understand how community responses to sex trafficking operate.

**Feminist Criminology**
Feminism

Feminist theory has been articulated as the extension of feminism into a theoretical perspective (Gedro and Mizzi 2014). In order to truly understand any feminist theory it is first important to understand and conceptualize feminism. Offen states that feminism encompasses “an ideology and movement for socio-political change based on critical analysis of male privilege and women’s subordination within any given society” (1988, 151). She further states that feminism “makes claims for a rebalancing between women and men of the social, economic, and political power within a given society” (Offen 1988, 152). Feminism should therefore be understood as a perspective that focuses on gender inequality in various intersecting aspects of a given society, with men being privileged with more social, economic and political capital as compared to women (Offen 1988; Simpson 1989; Flavin 2001; Hoffman 2001; Chambers 2013; Van Gundy 2014).

Feminist theory has been used to explain women’s oppression in society (Simpson 1989; Crittenden and Wright 2013; Van Gundy 2014). Ultimately the concept of the patriarchy existing in society dominates the focus of feminist theory. As stated by Hunnitcutt, patriarchy is defined as “social arrangements that privilege males, where men as a group dominate women as a group, both structurally and ideologically – hierarchical arrangements that manifest in varieties across history and social space” (2009, 557). Therefore, the patriarchy involves gender hierarchies, dominance and power arrangements within societal structures that ultimately favour men over women. These structures include those at the macro level in society, such as government, legal system, religion, etc., and also micro-structures, such as families, organizations or typical behaviour between intimate partners (Hunnitcutt 2009; Crittenden and Wright 2012).
Feminist theory advocates for the recognition and re-balancing of these patriarchal structures in society, with the ultimate goal of gender equality (Hoffman 2001; Crittenden and Wright 2012; Irwin and Adler 2012; Chambers 2013).

Feminist theorists contend that there are multiple “feminisms” that contribute to feminist theory (Anthias and Yuval-Davis 1983; Simpson 1989; Hoffman 2001; Davies 2011; Chambers 2013; Van Gundy 2014). There is no one feminist theory. Instead, theorizing should be understood as a multi-faceted framework with multiple theories falling under the realm of feminism (Simpson 1989; Hoffman 2001; Burgess-Proctor 2006; Chambers 2013). For this examination, a particular sub-theory born out of feminist theory will be the main focus – that being feminist criminology. Feminist criminology can be understood as a theory, framework, and approach.

**Feminist Criminology**

Feminist criminology originated in the late 1960s- early 1970s and was a product of second-wave feminism (Comack 1999; Chesney-Lind 2006; Heidensohn 2012; Chesney-Lind and Morash 2013). Feminist criminology was born out of a need to understand the role of gender in crime (Burgess-Proctor 2006; Chesney-Lind and Morash 2013; Van Gundy 2014). Specifically, feminist criminology stresses the underrepresentation of gender, in particular of women, and their experiences in criminological theory and research (Simpson 1989; Burgess-Proctor 2006; Chesney-Lind 2006; Van Gundy 2014). Feminist criminologists maintain that gender cannot be one variable among others when examining crime and social control. Instead, gender under a feminist criminology lens is the main focus. Moreover, theories that did consider gender before feminist criminology only considered women relative to men (Davies 2011;
Chesney-Lind and Morash 2013). Feminist criminology corrects this by looking at female victimization exclusively rather than comparing it to male victimization. This is also true of how the criminal justice system views gender in that women’s experiences are understood as relative to men rather than as independent experiences as a woman with individual differences (Davies 2011; Irwin and Adler 2012; Heidensohn 2012; Van Gundy 2014; Chesney-Lind and Chagnon 2016). In order to fully understand women and their experiences with victimization/crime, feminist criminology maintains that patriarchal structures must be understood as a real element in society that oppresses women and influences their lived experiences (Chesney-Lind 2006; Davies 2011; Irwin and Adler 2012).

Over the years, feminist criminology has expanded. This perspective has always emphasized understanding the experiences of women and girls at the individual level. However, as it has grown, feminist criminology has recognized the need to expand beyond examining solely gender in an understanding that women vary based on their differences (Burgess-Proctor 2006; Chesney-Lind and Morash 2013; De Coster and Heimer 2017). For the most part, these differences are based on race/ethnicity, class and other individual variables that may influence a woman’s lived experiences, as well as any personal history that could lead women to become victims of a violent crime (Chesney-Lind and Morash 2013; De Coster and Heimer 2017). This expansion is largely due to the influence of third-wave of feminism commencing in the 1980s (Burgess-Proctor 2006; Davies 2011; Van Gundy 2017). Third-wave feminism is noted as challenging heteronormative, male-dominated stereotypes of sex and sexuality. Feminists of the third-wave focus on allowing women to create their own identity, and celebrates the
differences within one’s identity that can be made up of their ethnicity, class, sexual orientation, etc. (Snyder 2008; Van Gundy 2014). For the purposes of feminist criminology, this focus on expanding one’s understanding of a woman and the various identities she has in addition to being a woman, allowed this perspective to grow in understanding how a woman experiences crime/social control/victimization.

The concept of intersectionality was born out of third-wave feminism. This concept was coined by Crenshaw (1991) and upon its inception, focused mainly on the intersection of three aspects of a woman’s identity – race, class and gender (Berger and Guidroz 2009). As stated by Hill, the core concept of intersectionality is that “systems of power cannot be understood in isolation from one another; instead, systems of power intersect and coproduce one another” (2010, 60). Therefore racism, sexism, class oppression, and any other suppression one faces within a given society cannot be understood as singular effects on an individual. Instead, intersectionality stresses the importance of understanding how these various systems interact with one another to oppress an individual. As the theory has expanded, other forms of oppression have been added to the perspective as essential in understanding how a woman experiences their oppression, such as sexuality, ethnicity, ableism, age, gender identity, and so on (Hearns 2011; Lutz et al. 2011; De Coster and Heimer 2017). In summary, intersectionality stresses the importance of understanding that the oppression of women cannot be understood outside of their multiple identities that may or may not cause them to experience unique/intersecting oppressions. It is also an essential theory to understand in order to grasp how feminist criminology has expanded/should continue to expand (Burgess-Proctor 2006; Chesney-Lind 2006; Chesney-Lind and Chagnon 2016).
Scholars such as Burgess-Proctor (2006) and Chesney-Lind (2006) maintain that the only way forward for feminist criminology is to incorporate an intersectional lens within criminological studies. As stated by Chesney-Lind,

Not infrequently, patriarchal interests overlap with systems that also reinforce class and race privilege, hence, the unique need for feminist criminology to maintain the focus on intersectionality that characterizes recent research and theorizing on gender and race in particular (2006, 9).

Therefore, in order to understand how any macro- or micro-structures, such as the criminal justice system and/or the law oppress women, it is important to understand that women are not universally oppressed in a similar manner. Instead, feminist criminology focuses on understanding women at an individual level and how they experience oppression based on the various aspects that make up their identity. It is for this reason that feminist criminology theory is an appropriate theoretical framework to draw on in an attempt to understand sex trafficking and community responses to it.

**Feminist Criminology and Sex trafficking**

Within feminist criminology, crimes involving violence against women are seen as a concrete example of how women are oppressed within society (Matthews 2000; Kilpatrick 2004; Lee 2008). Lee (2008) demonstrates this as she defines gendered violence as the manifestation of male entitlement and privilege in violent acts toward women. The feminist criminology discourse has generated a discussion on the structural barriers within society that were suppressing women from gaining fulfillment (Kilpatrick 2004). With this discovery, feminists began advocating for social and legal change to combat crimes involving violence against women, as they are crimes that are “frequently invisible or marginalized” (Matthews 2000, 311).
Sex trafficking is a crime that largely sees women as victims. Moreover, it is a crime that centres on the trafficker, typically male, exerting power and influence over their victim’s actions (Ali 2010; Winterdyk, Perrin and Reichel 2012; Gabriele et al. 2014). Feminist criminology theory is therefore an appropriate lens for this research as it focuses on the power imbalances between men and women in society and how this power imbalance influences individual’s actions (Chambers 2013). Chesney-Lind and Morash maintain that feminist criminology understands gender as a key force that shapes crime and social control and most importantly, gives powerless people a voice to express their views by promoting research to “reveal and promote justice” (2013, 288). As stated by Wesely:

Gender is an integral part of context concerning women’s violence because gender inequality and oppression in a patriarchal society parlay into individual, institutional, and structural marginalizations that contribute to women’s lived experiences. For instance, individual women can endure sexual, physical, and emotional degradation or victimization, be affected by restrictive institutional access to resources, and experience structural exclusions from economic power and social capital. These can combine in multiple and different ways to affect existing options of livelihood, coping, and survival (2006, 304).

When incorporating a feminist criminology approach, sex trafficking cannot be understood as an issue that results from a singular cause. Therefore, when discussing sex trafficking one must take into consideration all forms of oppression an individual woman may face before or during her victimization. Patriarchy can almost certainly be considered as one dominant reason for sex trafficking; however, other intersecting factors, such as race/ethnicity/culture, class, sexuality, and/or disability, may also be contributing factors.

**Community Psychology**
In addition to feminist criminology, the theoretical framework of community psychology is relevant to this research (Boyd 2014). Community psychology first appeared as a subfield of psychology in the 1960s (Prilleltensky 2001; Wolff 2014). Nelson and Prilleltensky define this theory as the “subdiscipline of psychology that is concerned with understanding people in the context of their communities, the prevention of problems of living, the celebration of human diversity, and the pursuit of social justice through social action” (2010, 23). Levine et al. (2005) and Case, Todd and Kral (2014) further explain that community psychology is a multi-dimensional framework that has many approaches working toward one common goal – helping disempowered individuals take control of their lives within a certain environment through the use of social systems. These social systems together accomplish specific goals within a given community, such as promoting individual growth, and providing immediate and appropriate forms of intervention when needed. Therefore, their main focus is on the person in an environment, and what that social environment can do to empower an individual (Prilleltensky 2001; Levine et al. 2005; Wolff 2014). As stated by Javandi and Allen, “empowerment is regarded as an important phenomenon of interest for community psychologists … and as central to the success of a wide range of social change efforts” (2010, 208). Common goals included in community psychology are prevention, collaboration, self-help, coalition building and wellness promotion (Prilleltensky 2001).

Within the overarching framework of community psychology exists the essential component of focusing on social and systems change, and empowerment of residents within a given community (Prilleltensky 2001; Wolff 2014). This focus on change and empowerment has become more widely used within the discourse of community
psychology to explain macro-level organization of systems (Peirson, Boydell, Ferguson and Ferris 2011; Wolff 2014). The purpose of this perspective is to understand how various organizations collaborate to ignite change in a given community in order to achieve a desired outcome (Foster-Fishman and Behrens 2007).

**Community Psychology and Responding to Sex Trafficking**

Community psychology is an appropriate theoretical framework to use for this research as it defines a system as two or more entities working together toward a common goal by creating one organized and collaborative structure (Battista 1977; van Gigh 1974). This directly reflects the way in which the anti-sex trafficking coalitions included in this study are created and organized, as they are structures that encompass several organizations coming together toward the common goal of responding to human trafficking within their jurisdiction. In the context of the proposed research, a community psychology theoretical framework is therefore adopted to understand the process of the anti-human trafficking coalitions’ attempts to respond to sex trafficking as a multidimensional process. The process is considered multidimensional as it includes various partners of government and non-governmental organizations working together to accomplish the same goal of responding to human trafficking. Furthermore, this framework guides the understanding of how the coalitions create change to better address human trafficking.

**Incorporating Feminist Criminology and Community Psychology**

The theoretical frameworks of feminist criminology and community psychology are used in this study in a complimentary fashion. The feminist criminology framework provides a lens to understand the subject of this study, that being the gendered crime of
sex trafficking. This feminist approach will be used to examine the subject of this research so as to better understand how societal structures influenced by patriarchal values influence women’s lives and ultimately contribute to how and/or why they experience exploitation. Moreover, with the expansion of feminist criminology to include an intersectional lens when examining women’s involvement in crime, this theory adds to this study a framework to better understand the experiences of these trafficking victims and the response these women receive from organizations and individuals within their given society.

Whereas the feminist criminological perspective provides a framework to better understand the subject of this study, the community psychology perspective provides a framework to examine the sample of this study – that being the anti-human trafficking coalitions, as parts of a system attempting to work in a coordinated way. This perspective provides a framework to understand how a multi-faceted system, or coalition, work together in empowering one another to create change within their given community. This perspective further provides a framework to examine the coalitions’ design and implementation of means to achieve their goals when responding to sex trafficking. This perspective will therefore provide a framework to examine how the included anti-trafficking approaches work together to empower one another to respond effectively to sex trafficking.
Chapter 3: Methodology

Human trafficking is considered an exceptionally difficult topic to gather primary data on due to the underreported and often misunderstood nature of the crime (Gabriele et al. 2014; Weitzer 2014). It can also be considered a dangerous task from the perspective of the researcher’s involvement given the massive amounts of money traffickers stand to lose should they be exposed and/or should human trafficking be eradicated (Weitzer 2014; Palmiotto 2015; Zawilski 2015). A great amount of time and effort was put in to designing research that would gain firsthand understanding of human trafficking and the efforts employed in Canadian communities to respond to this crime.

The purpose of this research is twofold. The main purpose is to understand and analyze the specific approaches used by community coalitions in Ontario to address sex trafficking within their jurisdiction. The second purpose of this research is to compare the coalitions with one another, with a particular focus on the differences that exist between the included community coalitions and provincial approaches.

An opportunity to gather data on responses to human trafficking was presented in the form of a three-day knowledge mobilizing conference on human trafficking in 2015 in Ontario. This conference brought together service providers and academics that work toward responding to human trafficking and assisting victims of this crime in local communities throughout Ontario. In order to register for the conference, participants had to successfully complete two online courses created by Multilingual Community Interpreters Services (MCIS) Language Services, and British Columbia’s Office to Combat Trafficking in Persons. These courses largely focused on providing indicators for individuals to detect human trafficking, and provided training for service providers on
how to respond to trafficking victims. After completing the courses and registering, this researcher contacted the conference organizers to ask about the possibility of gathering data from conference speakers and conference delegates during the conference. Once this researcher knew what was acceptable to the conference organizers an ethics application was submitted to the research ethics board at the University of Guelph. This researcher decided to conduct participant-observer research as a delegate of the conference in order to gather data to answer the following research questions:

1. What are the anti-human trafficking approaches in Ontario communities?

2. How do these Ontario community responses to human trafficking differ from provincial approaches in Canada?

This chapter will outline the methodology and methods used to conduct this participant-observer research and the subsequent data analysis. A thematic analysis was conducted as the main source of data analysis and will therefore be discussed in depth in this chapter both in broad and specific terms as it applies to this research. The chapter will end with a discussion on the limitations of the research methods employed and a reflection on the research process as a whole.

**Research Design**

Qualitative research is the study of practical issues that use data sources other than numbers as empirical material (Marshall and Rossman 1989; Flick 2007; Westermarland 2014). Denzin and Lincoln define qualitative research as the study of things “in their natural settings, attempting to make sense of, or interpret, phenomena in terms of the meanings people bring to them” (2005, 3). The goal of qualitative research is often to understand an issue or produce knowledge that is relevant to the issue in a real-world setting (Marshall and Rossman 1989; Flick 2007; Rinehart and Yeater 2011;
Nowell et al. 2017). Qualitative research is particularly suited to criminology as it provides a means of researching those subjects that are difficult to observe with official data, such as those typically used in quantitative methods (Noakes and Wincup 2004; Rinehart and Yeater 2011; Westermarland 2014; Jerolmach and Khan 2014). This is particularly suited, then, to an underreported crime such as sex trafficking.

One method that can be used to collect data for a qualitative analysis is ethnography. Ethnography typically involves researchers immersing themselves into real-world situations/environments of a targeted group of persons for the purpose of observing them in their natural settings (Noaks and Wincup 2004; Chan 2013; Westmarland 2014; Jerolmach and Khan 2014). The degree to which the subjects are aware of the researchers’ identification as an outsider to the group can vary in ethnography, ranging from full-identification to researchers adopting a cover identity as a member of that same group (Calvey 2013; Chan 2013; Putt 2013). Ethnography is typically conducted through the use of participant-observation and/or in-depth interviews (Schensul, Schensul and LeCompte 1999; Noakes and Wincup 2004; Putt 2013; Jaimangal-Jones 2014). For the purpose of this study, ethnographic research was conducted by using participant-observation.

The participant-observer role can be broken down into two pieces that occur simultaneously – that of observing and participating. First and foremost, Marshall and Rossman define observation as “the systematic description of events, behaviour and artifacts in the social setting chosen for study” (1989, 79). Erlandson et al. (1993) state that the act of observing and the data collected as a result allows researchers to provide a ‘written photograph’ of the topic under study. Therefore, the role of participant-observer
involves the researcher observing the sample they wish to study while in a natural setting for that sample. In addition, the participant-observer role involves actively participating in the context in which they are immersed (Jerolmach and Khan 2014; Jaimangal-Jones 2014). The participant-observer thereby learns through exposure or involvement in the activities of the participant(s) in the study (Schensul, Schensul and LeCompte 1999; Putt 2013; Jerolmach and Khan 2014; Jaimangal-Jones 2014). The role of being a participant-observer therefore provides the researcher with a unique opportunity to observe and gather data on a particular topic.

The main method of data collection used for this research was participant-observation. This data was collected at a conference in South-western Ontario during the summer of 2015. The conference was held over three days and included seven individual presentations from community coalitions and provincial approaches from across Canada. These coalitions included the Ottawa Coalition to End Human Trafficking (OCEHT), the London-based Coalition Assisting Trafficked Individuals, the Toronto Counter Human Trafficking Network (TCHTN), the York Region Anti-Human Trafficking Committee (YRAHTC), Alberta’s Action Coalition on Human Trafficking (ACT Alberta), British Columbia’s Office to Combat Trafficking in Persons (OCTIP) and lastly Manitoba’s Tracia’s Trust. See Appendix A for a synopsis on each of these approaches. As a participant-observer, this researcher completed the same pre-requisite online courses that were mandatory for all members of the conference. These online courses were mandatory to ensure that all members of the audience had a beyond beginner level of knowledge regarding human trafficking before the conference began. Furthermore, this researcher attended each presentation and sat with the members of the audience, which was largely
comprised of service providers and members of criminal justice organizations who were equally learning of the different approaches employed by each of the Ontario and provincial coalitions. This comprised the observation portion of this research. The participation portion took place before and after the conference in the form of social gatherings pre-arranged by the conference, and also in between presentations when there was time to discuss the content of each approach. This researcher was equally granted the option to participate by asking questions after each presentation in the same way that each member of the audience was entitled to.

The main goal of each presentation was to provide an overview on their approach to respond to human trafficking in a particular geographic area/jurisdiction. In addition to researcher field notes taken during the presentations, presenters’ power point slides and handouts distributed to conference delegates are the data that were used for analysis. As explained by Vinten (1994), the method of participant-observer provides firsthand understanding on a topic to the researcher. This researcher learned about the approaches used to respond to human trafficking from the presenters’ perspective and also developed rapport with the presenters/delegates and the audience by being a conference delegate.

The focus for this research before the data collection process began was broad, knowing only that the concentration would be on understanding and comparing each community coalition and provincial approach’s response to human trafficking. The research questions were created using an inductive approach (Braun and Clarke 2006; Palys and Atchison 2014) after gathering and reviewing the data and understanding exactly what could be examined using this particular method of data collection. Further
analysis was conducted after the research questions were generated in the form of a thematic analysis.

**Thematic Analysis**

Thematic analysis is a qualitative research method employed to identify and analyze patterns or themes in an existing set of data (Boyatzis 1998; Braun and Clarke 2006; Fereday and Muir-Cochrane 2006; Guest, MacQueen and Namey 2012). Braun and Clarke define a theme as capturing a part of a data set that relates to the particular research question(s), and represents some level of “patterned response” or meaning (2006, 10). Therefore, a thematic analysis involves analyzing a data set by identifying central themes that capture essential aspects of the data set to answer the research question(s) guiding the research.

When conducting a thematic analysis, a researcher can choose between the positivist approach and the interpretivist approach (Boyatzis 1998; Braun and Clarke 2006; Guest, MacQueen and Namey 2012). This research utilized the positivist approach. The approach is rooted in incorporating a scientific method into analyses. Bernard and Ryan (1998) state the positivist approach to conducting qualitative research is based around deducing data into codes in order to try and simulate quantitative analysis with what is often text-based data. Boyatzis (1998) describes this as the ‘semantic’ approach to conducting thematic analysis, stating that the analysis includes the researcher identifying themes in a given data set and subscribing meaning to the existing data in order to categorize the data into the overarching themes. The researcher does not go beyond what a participant has provided to the data set. Should the researcher go beyond, they would be adopting the interpretivist approach (Geertz 1973; Boyatzis 1998).
One of the major advantages in using a thematic analysis to analyze data is the flexible nature of this method (Braun and Clarke 2006; Fereday and Muir-Cochrane 2006; Nowell et al. 2017). In this study, this flexibility allowed the data and the research questions to come together before adapting the thematic analysis to fit the data. Another advantage in using a thematic analysis is it provides an avenue to compare similarities and differences across a data set. This is especially beneficial when considering the second research question guiding this research. Furthermore, thematic analysis is considered an easier method for the general public to understand who may not necessarily have had experience with thematic or other qualitative analyses (Braun and Clarke 2006; Nowell, et al. 2017). This is certainly considered advantageous, as the results of this research will be shared with those who attended the conference should they wish to see them, and thereafter shared within their coalition. Knowledge mobilization is likely with the use of thematic analysis.

**Research Site**

The sample used in this research was limited to seven conference presenters and approximately 50 delegates. No recruitment process was required. Out of seven presenters, four were community coalitions from cities in Ontario: Ottawa, Toronto, London and York. The remaining three were provincial approaches from Western Canada comprising of British Columbia, Alberta and Manitoba. One person representing each approach spoke on behalf of the community/province. Each presentation lasted for approximately an hour and twenty minutes followed by a ten minute question period open for audience questions or comments. The presentations centred on each coalition’s unique approach in responding to human trafficking within their jurisdiction. The
conference delegates and presenters included professionals from areas of social services and the criminal justice system, such as law enforcement officials from provincial and municipal levels, and members of the Attorney General’s office.

**Data Collection**

Participant-observer researcher field notes comprised the majority of the data. These were comprised on a personal laptop and notebook and were then combined into one Microsoft Word document after the conference. In total, 44 double spaced typed pages of field notes were produced along with seven PowerPoint presentations and 20 handouts from the community/provincial coalitions. One of the PowerPoint presentations was not included in this research as it was presented by a group in Ottawa that focused on employing victims of human trafficking, and did not specifically present an approach to respond to human trafficking. Furthermore, this group is a member of the Ottawa community coalition that did present and their information was therefore included as part of this researcher’s field notes data. A slideshow presentation was not collected from the York coalition, as they did not present one at this conference. This data was compiled together and sorted by Ontario coalition/provincial approach in order to conduct the subsequent data analyses.

**Data Analysis**

**Thematic Analysis**

Braun and Clarke (2006) describe the first step of conducting a thematic analysis as the step where the researcher familiarises themselves with the data by repeatedly reading through the data. During this phase, certain patterns naturally emerged. One of the more prominent patterns that emerged was that of the “four Ps,” that directly reflected
the RCMP’s outline in their National Action Plan as discussed in Chapter 1. The four P’s included prevention, protection, prosecution and partnerships. A handout was provided by one of the Ontario coalitions that listed the four P’s and what they considered to be part of their mandate under each ‘P’. These four P’s were therefore used as a framework to conduct a thematic analysis and report on findings. These four themes were used to answer how Ontario community coalitions operate to respond to human trafficking in their jurisdiction, and to compare these community coalitions and the three provincial approaches that were presented by Canadian provinces. With this, this researcher decided to use these four Ps to create a conceptual framework for which to examine each of the coalitions and approaches involved in the sample of this study. This conceptual framework provided a lens to not only understand but also analyze and determine gaps in each of the coalitions’ approaches in responding to human trafficking.

**Coding Scheme**

Guest, MacQueen and Namey define a code as a “textual description of the semantic boundaries of a theme … A code is a formal rendering of a theme” (2012, 279). The act of coding involves the researcher taking data in the form of text and reducing it into specific codes in order to define the themes. Using the positivist coding approach the researcher read through the data and assigned pre-conceived codes (Bernard and Ryan 1998; Boyatzis 1998; Flick 2007). The coding scheme employed to conduct this thematic analysis is available in a Codebook (Appendix B). The codes fitting under the corresponding theme can be seen in Figure 1. Presented under each theme in the results section of this research are frequency distributions, which highlight how many examples of each indicator was found in the data and under which “P” the indicators fit. For
example, the presenter provided an example of a method used to spread awareness on the occurrence of human trafficking in the presentation, this would be counted as “1” indicator of Prevention: Information and Awareness. Each occurrence was then added up and the sums of these occurrences are provided in the frequency distributions seen in the Results chapter.

*Figure 1*

*Indicators Used to Code 4Ps*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Prevention</th>
<th>Protection</th>
<th>Prosecution</th>
<th>Partnerships</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Indicators</td>
<td>Information and Awareness</td>
<td>Train Service Providers</td>
<td>Train law enforcement</td>
<td>Enhance Collaboration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indicators</td>
<td>Practical Prevention Strategies</td>
<td>Support and Assist Victims</td>
<td>Supporting Investigations</td>
<td>Inform Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indicators</td>
<td>Reduce Vulnerabilities</td>
<td>Protect Vulnerable Populations</td>
<td>Improve Detection</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Braun and Clarke (2006) and Attride-Stirling (2001) explain that the researcher needs to be able to tell a story with each theme that fits into the overall story the research as a whole tells. The codes aid in telling this story, as they guide the thematic analysis in order to determine which pieces of the data should fit under each theme. The coding for this research was completed using a print out of the field notes and the handouts given during the conference. The results from this thematic analysis are discussed in Chapter 4.

**Limitations of Research Design**

One of the main limitations of this research is the use of a conference as the data collection site. While several anti-human trafficking approaches were presented, and each was provided with ample time to speak, limitations existed. That is, the data is restricted
to the information that is provided at the conference, within the presenters’ presentations
and the questions asked by delegates during the question period. Moreover, each of the
presenters was provided instructions by the coordinators of the conference on what to
concentrate on during their allotted presentation time. This could leave out important
information about a community coalition/provincial approach’s efforts to respond to
human trafficking due to a presenter’s choice to not include the information in the
presentation. According to Palys and Atchison (2014) this is a common limitation when
conducting ethnographic research such as the participant-observation method, as the
researcher is relying on circumstances and an environment beyond their control.

Another limitation to consider with the use the participant-observation is the
potential for reactivity to hinder the reliability of the data (Neuman 2003; Sangasubana
2011). Sangasubana (2011) and Vinten (1987) define reactivity as participants in a given
study altering their behaviour due to the known presence of a researcher. Therefore, there
is a chance that by acting as a participant-observer at the conference, there may be a
decrease in the reliability of the information collected, as presenters/participants knew
ahead of their presentations that participant-observation research was being conducted at
the conference. The presenters may have therefore geared their discussions in such a way
to make their approach sound desirable instead of being truthful.

Finally, thematic analyses can limit what is included in the analysis from the data
(Braun and Clarke 2006). Creating themes to specifically focus on can restrict the
analysis and thereby exclude other information that could be influential. Another
common limitation of thematic analyses is that they can be more descriptive in nature
rather than analytical whereby the data is simply categorized rather than analyzed (Guest,
MacQueen and Namey 2012). This researcher attempted to combat this limitation by ensuring that analysis on the information was conducted through comparing the anti-human trafficking coalitions with one another and comparing community and provincial approaches.

**Researcher Reflexivity**

Acting as a participant-observer at a conference geared toward service providers and criminal justice officials responding to human trafficking offered this researcher a unique experience. At the beginning of this project, this researcher considered interviews, focus groups and other data gathering methods to capture information on anti-human trafficking community coalitions in Ontario before discovering the conference where the participant-observer research was conducted.

Conducting research on topics in sociology/criminology can often be met with many challenges by a researcher. Human trafficking can be considered one of the most underreported, misunderstood and arguably sensitive subjects in the field of criminology (Gabriele at al. 2014; Zawilski 2015; Palmiotto 2015). This researcher therefore found it essential to remain reflexive throughout the research process. As explained in existing literature, to remain reflexive is for a researcher to be self-critical of the potential influences that could bias the researcher throughout the research process (May 1999; Tobin and Begley 2004; Palys and Atchison 2014; Nowell et al. 2017). Given the sensitive nature of sex trafficking, this researcher attempted to remain aware of any potential internal or external biases that could influence the data collected in this study.
Chapter 4: Results

This chapter outlines the results related to this research study. The research questions sought to understand and examine community coalitions in Ontario that are working to respond to human trafficking. In addition, this research sought to compare these community coalitions with provincial coalitions to understand the similarities and differences that exist between these approaches. The following chapter is broken down into sections to effectively answer each research question.

What are community coalitions?

This section will outline the results of the thematic analysis conducted on the data collected at the Summer Conference on Human Trafficking with a focus on the four Ontario community coalitions included in the sample. As outlined in the previous chapter, the thematic analysis was conducted using the framework of the four P’s comprising of prevention, prosecution, protection and partnerships. The Codebook (as seen in Appendix B) provides the criteria for coding each of these themes. The follow section will begin with the results seen under the first theme of protection.

Ontario Coalition Findings

Ontario P1: Protection

The theme of protection was the most prevalent throughout the Ontario community coalition presentations. Victims of human trafficking were the focus of this theme. As illustrated in figure 2, this theme was coded using three indicators – Supporting and Assisting Trafficked Persons, Training Service Providers, and Protecting Vulnerable Populations. The results are elaborated upon below and provided in the form of a bar graph and frequency distribution in figure 2. By way of example, the writer notes that for
the Ottawa coalition the number 8 appears under Indicator 1, Support and Assist Trafficked Persons. This means that when conducting the thematic analysis on this research, the researcher coded the indicator ‘Support and Assist Trafficked Persons’ on 8 distinct occurrences in the data collected from the Ottawa coalition.

Figure 2

The following three items are indicators of a Protection focus.

![Results for Protection (P1) for Ontario Coalitions](image)

As seen in the above table, the four coalitions mostly referred to their work to support and assist trafficked persons, followed closely by references to train service providers. The coalition from Toronto was the only coalition to provide evidence of their work in all three indicators. These results are elaborated upon more fully below.

**Ontario P1 Protection: Indicator 1) Support and Assist Trafficked Persons**

Supporting and assisting trafficked persons was the main focus of the Ontario coalitions. Each of the four Ontario community coalitions’ discussed how their approach
directly support victims of human trafficking. The need to provide safe housing to the
trafficking victims was identified by all coalitions:

We provide services to meet the acute, immediate and long-term resource
and support needs of persons affected by all forms of human trafficking,
including persons who are at risk. We provide victims with food and
emergency groceries, clothing, access to computers and/or a phone, access
to laundry and access to housing (OCEHT Representative 2015).

We use a community-oriented approach for the delivery of services to
individuals in situations of human trafficking … we want to create safe
houses that are apartments. And the location keeps moving to create the
safety. We then want the survivor to eventually take over the lease (CATI
Representative 2015).

When delivering these services, the Ontario coalitions placed an emphasis on making
their approaches “victim-oriented” (OCEHT Representative 2015) or “survivor-centred”
(YRAHTC Representative 2015). With that, the victim remains the main focus for all of
the service providers. Additionally, Toronto’s TCHTN argued that a community coalition
needs to offer the victim whatever they need. TCHTN asserted that most victims of
trafficking are in a tenuous spot once initially extracted from their trafficker, and can be
easily tipped back to the hands of the trafficker if not provided by every service needed.
They provided examples of coffee and cigarettes as simple needs expressed by victims
that can be easily provided, and can also be used to bribe a victim back into the arms of
their trafficker should service providers refuse to do so (TCHTN Representative 2015).

**Ontario P1 Protection: Indicator 2) Train Service Providers**

All four of the Ontario community coalitions provided evidence of training
service providers as part of their mandate. The coalitions stressed this as an essential
component to their approach to address human trafficking:

We provide training free of charge two times a year … we provide
training to traditional and non-traditional service providers on indicators
of human trafficking and appropriate responses. We provide identifiers to find human trafficking victims and then once identified what the response should be (OCEHT Representative 2015).

We have found that front line workers need human trafficking training to recognize human trafficking victims. We found that stigma was against victims in the way service providers delivered their services. They need sensitivity, anti-oppressive and feminist training (YRAHTC Representative 2015).

OCEHT and CATI defined traditional service providers as front-line workers within the social services field, versus non-traditional service providers as those who work in professions outside of the social services realm that may come across victims of human trafficking. OCEHT provided examples of educators, hotel staff, and transportation staff, such as taxi drivers, as non-traditional workers they have trained on human trafficking. CATI offered a list of human trafficking indicators it provided in training that included aspects such as a person being unaware of local surroundings even though they have been in the area for an extended period of time, showing evidence of control, intimidation or abnormal psychological fear, and/or having bruises or showing other signs of abuse. A full list of the indicators provided by CATI can be seen in Appendix C.

**Ontario P1 Protection: Indicator 3) Protect Vulnerable Populations**

The Toronto community coalition was the only Ontario coalition to discuss the protection of vulnerable populations. TCHTN stated that coalitions need to include services for aspects of all parts of an individual’s identity, including immigration status, language ability, experiences with violence, gender identity, sexual identity and cultural barriers. As stated by the representative from TCHTN an anti-human trafficking coalition needs to address all aspects of a person’s identity as a person will react based on these
identities (TCHTN Representative 2015). TCHTN specifically highlighted the experience of the LGBTQ+ community, and certain needs that members of this community may have which other trafficking victims would not necessarily need to consider:

We need to be aware that we don’t do harm when … providing services. For example, transgender women do sex work because they are discriminated against in employment. And medication is expensive for transgender people. This is a particular concern for international people that do not have access to health care (TCHTN Representative 2015).

**Ontario P2: Prevention**

The indicators used to code for the Prevention theme were Information and Awareness Campaigns, Practical Prevention Strategies and Reducing Vulnerabilities. The results demonstrated that anti-trafficking coalitions at the community level focus overwhelmingly on Information and Awareness Campaigns in comparison to the other indicators within this theme. The results are presented below.

*Figure 3*

*The following three items are indicators of a Prevention focus.*

**Results for Prevention (P2) for Ontario Coalitions**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Information and Awareness</th>
<th>Practical Prevention Strategies</th>
<th>Reducing Vulnerabilities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>London</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>York</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As is demonstrated in the above table, the coalitions focused overwhelmingly on raising awareness and spreading information about human trafficking in order to prevent further trafficking occurrences. Moreover, the York coalition was the only coalition to provide evidence of implementing practical prevention strategies. These results are elaborated upon below.

**Ontario P2 Prevention: Indicator 1) Information and Awareness Campaigns**

As demonstrated in Figure 3, evidence of information and awareness campaigns were presented by each of the four Ontario community coalitions discussed above. These campaigns largely focus on spreading awareness on what the crime of human trafficking entails, how common it is and where people can find help if they suspect they or someone they know is being trafficked. What is noteworthy about these information and awareness campaigns is their use of the Internet. Each community coalition spoke of their website and/or social media accounts, such as Twitter or Facebook, that are used to spread awareness on the crime of human trafficking, as well as to inform the public on their work to combat human trafficking through social media.¹

Another method for spreading awareness and/or information by these community coalitions was through the use of posters and brochures to be distributed at various locations throughout their individual communities. Included in the presentation for London’s CATI and Ottawa’s OCEHT were handouts of the posters used by these coalitions. An example of a poster given to each delegate at the conference can be seen in Appendix E.

**Ontario P2 Prevention: Indicator 2) Practical Prevention Strategies**

¹ See Appendix D – for websites/social media accounts.
As demonstrated in Figure 3, the coalition from York was the only coalition to provide evidence of a practical prevention strategy at this conference. This comprised coalition members creating workshops for youth that are presented to students at their local schools. These workshops are for both male and female students and include a male survivor of sex trafficking meeting with male students, and a female survivor of sex trafficking meeting with the female students (YRAHTC Representative 2015). A main aspect of this workshop was to highlight the importance of educating young men about violence against women. As stated by the York speaker, “the huge issue in sex trafficking is the demand for sex” (2015). The purpose of these workshops is to help prevent and reduce this demand (YRAHTC Representative 2015).

During the question period of York’s presentation the York presenter provided another example of a practical prevention strategy via their outreach group, who they were training to use social media to build rapport with youth (YRAHTC Representative 2015). This would include writing blogs or using websites such as Twitter to spread information that youth can relate to. The presenter emphasized they would not necessarily speak about human trafficking immediately, but would instead attempt to speak in terms that youth could more easily relate to before broaching such a serious subject. The purpose of this outreach was to spread awareness but also to attempt to prevent further victimization and/or reduce the demand for purchasing sex by reaching boys while they are still in their youth to educate them about the potential harm involved in sex trafficking (YRAHTC Representative 2015).

**Ontario P2 Prevention: Indicator 3) Reducing Vulnerabilities**
There was no evidence from any of the four Ontario community coalitions of an attempt to reduce vulnerabilities of trafficking victims. The London coalition (CATI) presented an exercise for the conference delegates to participate in that focused on the overrepresentation of trafficked First Nations women and girls. London identified the effect poverty has on First Nations children and its link to increased vulnerability. However, there was no discussion of what CATI is doing in order reduce these vulnerabilities.

**Ontario P3: Prosecution**

Within the prosecution theme, Training Law Enforcement and Criminal Justice Officials, Supporting Investigations and Prosecutions, and Improving Detection of Exploitation were the indicators used for coding. The main point discussed for this theme by the Ontario community coalitions was that a tenuous relationship exists between the coalitions and their criminal justice counterparts, such as police officers and Crown attorneys. These results are discussed more in-depth below and provided in figure 4.

*Figure 4*

*The following three items are indicators of a Prosecution focus.*
As demonstrated in the figure above, the four coalitions collectively made reference most frequently on their work to support investigations and prosecutions against traffickers under the prosecution theme. The results of this theme are further presented below.

**Ontario P3 Prosecution: Code 1) Training Criminal Justice Officials**

When speaking of training criminal justice officials, each of the four Ontario community coalitions discussed training law enforcement above any other criminal justice officials. Specifically, each of the community coalitions provided evidence of training their law enforcement counterparts within the municipal police force of their community. This training typically focused on sensitizing authorities to human trafficking, and largely provided tips on how best to treat a victim of trafficking. Of the four coalitions, the most concrete example of the training done with law enforcement and other criminal justice personnel was delivered through a hypothetical scenario by a police officer in the audience who had received training from London’s CATI:
say [the police] get a call about shouting or whatever in a hotel room. When I get there I am looking for three things: threat to life, weapons and drugs. I don’t care about the gender or the circumstances of why this girl is there. But with human trafficking training, now I’m considering is this possibly a case of human trafficking? (Member of Southwestern Police Force 2015).

The training conducted by the coalitions therefore sensitizes law enforcement personnel on human trafficking, thereby bringing this subject to the forefront of a police officers thought-making process when on the front-line and interacting with a potential trafficking victim.

**Ontario P3 Prosecution: Indicator 2) Supporting Investigations and Prosecutions**

As illustrated in Figure 4, each of the community coalitions provided evidence of supporting investigations and prosecutions of traffickers. For each of the coalitions, this assistance takes the form of supporting a victim during the criminal justice process. This involves supporting the victim before, during, and after the trials involved with convicting the individual(s) responsible for trafficking them. It is in this practice that the coalitions found most of their difficulties in dealing with their criminal justice counterparts. As explained by London’s CATI and Toronto’s TCHTN, the difficulty is twofold. Not only do the community coalitions find it difficult to engage with the police and have them understand what human trafficking is, and how important it is for them to be sensitive with trafficking victims, but also the trafficking victim can make this relationship even more difficult. Often, these victims have been taught to mistrust law enforcement. This is particularly true for international victims of human trafficking, who may come from nations with corrupt and/or violent police officers (TCHTN Representative 2015).
In addition to difficulties with the police, representatives from each of the community coalitions and delegates in the audience discussed at length their issues with crown attorneys during the conviction of a human trafficker, such as the crown attorney’s lack of empathy toward the victim, and a lack of understanding of the difficulties surrounding a trial for a trafficking victim. OCEHT further identified crown attorneys’ lack of trauma awareness as a detriment to how long a victim will participate as a witness in a trial (OCEHT Representative 2015). Surrounding this discussion was the potential use of video camera testimony, so that a victim would not have to be in court face-to-face with their trafficker, however representatives from within the community coalitions and the conference delegates noted the difficulties in this approach, not only in getting a crown attorney to agree to this, but also in dehumanizing the victim to the jury to the point where the testimony may not be strong enough to secure a conviction against the trafficker.

**Ontario P3 Prosecution: Indicator 3) Improving Detection of Trafficking**

Improving the detection of trafficking for the purpose of prosecuting a trafficker was not discussed by any of the four community coalitions. Instead, this focus was provided in the context of improving detection of victims of trafficking so as to provide necessary support and assistance to these individuals.

**Ontario P4: Partnerships**

The last theme used in this thematic analysis is Partnerships. Overall, this theme was the second-most discussed theme at the conference, behind Protection. This theme comprises two indicators: Enhancing Engagement and Collaboration, and Informing Policy. The presentations delivered by the four Ontario community coalitions did not
provide any evidence of informing policy responses toward sex trafficking, and instead were centred on the first indicator of Enhancing Engagement and Collaboration. These findings are discussed in more detail below and provided in figure 5.

Figure 5

The following three items are indicators of a Partnerships focus.

Results for Partnerships (P4) for Ontario Coalitions

As is demonstrated in the above figure, all four coalitions only provided evidence of enhancing engagement and collaboration under the partnerships theme. None of the Ontario coalitions made reference of work being conducted to inform policy responses. These results are elaborated upon below.

Ontario P4 Partnerships Indicator 1) Enhance Engagement and Collaboration

All four of the Ontario community coalitions stated that engaging and collaborating with partners in their communities was an essential component in their approach. These coalitions described themselves as community-based networks of local
organizations, service providers and community members, designed to collaborate with multiple partners to work as one body to address human trafficking:

Our vision statement is being a community oriented approach for the delivery of services to individuals in situations of human trafficking, and acts to create a global community where human trafficking cannot thrive (CATI Representative 2015).

Our mandate is to provide a comprehensive response to human trafficking in the Toronto area. The response is to be provided in a collaborative manner with governmental and non-governmental organizations, agencies and individuals (TCHTN Representative 2015).

What is further demonstrated by the Ontario coalitions under the Partnerships theme was their view of partnerships as a necessary means to accomplish their goals – that being the prevention of human trafficking, prosecution of traffickers, and protection of trafficking victims. Therefore, this fourth theme of partnerships appears to be a necessary component in order to accomplish the goals set out in the other three themes of this research. A case study provided by London’s CATI further illustrates this, as a victim who needed various services, such as medical and immigration services, was able to receive them due to the strong partnerships created by CATI:

One case that we saw in London was an international sex trafficking case where the victim was taken from her controllers by a helper she met in a bar the victim was working in. The helper took her to an immigration lawyer who recognized human trafficking. The lawyer then got in touch with a community member of CATI. The victim wanted to stay with the helper so shelter wasn’t needed. We got medical help through our medical partners of CATI. The CATI community member accompanied the victim to her medical meetings. The victim was given contact to a CATI counselling partner, who then took on the role of being the victim’s Case Manager as an ongoing basis. The victim also went to CIC [Citizenship and Immigration Canada] with two members of CATI to get a Temporary Residency Permit, which she received (CATI Representative 2015).

**Ontario P4 Partnerships Indicator 2) Inform Policy Response**
Throughout the presentations delivered by the four Ontario community coalitions, there were no concrete examples offered to describe how any of them had informed a policy response to human trafficking. On one occasion, London’s CATI talked about meeting with city counsellors in London-Middlesex county, but nothing to suggest these informal meetings lead to policy development. Instead, CATI described these meetings as being designed to raise awareness on human trafficking as a whole.

In summary, these four Ontario community coalitions were found to include aspects of all four themes used to conduct this data analysis. First, these Ontario community coalitions provide a focus on protecting trafficking victims by directly supporting and assisting trafficked persons and training service providers to do so. In addition, these Ontario coalitions provided evidence of preventing sex trafficking from occurring through spreading information and awareness on human trafficking itself. Third, these coalitions seek to prosecute traffickers by training law enforcement/criminal justice authorities while also supporting ongoing investigations and prosecutions of traffickers. Lastly, in order to accomplish the three goals outlined in the first three themes of this research, these Ontario coalitions demonstrated under the partnerships theme their focus on enhancing collaboration and engagement between various governmental and non-governmental organizations within their given jurisdiction.

**Comparison of Ontario to Provincial Approaches**

The following section will provide the results of the thematic analysis on the three provincial approaches to respond to human trafficking included in this sample – Alberta’s Action Coalition on Human Trafficking (ACT), British Columbia’s Office to Combat Trafficking in Persons (OCTIP), and Manitoba’s Tracia’s Trust. This section will provide
an overview of the results for the purpose of creating a means to compare these provincial approaches to the Ontario community coalitions.

**P1: Protection**

A comparison between the four Ontario community coalitions and the provincial approaches demonstrates that the provincial approaches provided an equal focus on the protection of trafficking victims. However, the provincial approaches did not present as many concrete, real-life examples of their work to protect victims in the same manner as the Ontario coalitions. The results found under each indicator are discussed further below and presented in *Figure 6*.

*Figure 6*

*The following three items are indicators of a Protection focus.*
Figure 7

The following provides a cumulative frequency for the four Ontario coalitions and three provincial models under the indicators with a Protection focus.

Comparing Ontario Coalitions and Provincial Approaches for P1
As can be seen in the above two figures, both the Ontario coalitions and provincial approaches made the most references under the support and assist trafficked persons indicator, with training service providers counted as the second most frequent indicator referenced. These results are elaborated upon below.

**P1 Protection Ontario & Provincial Approaches: a) Unique Support and Assistance for Trafficked Persons**

Similar to the Ontario coalitions, all three of the provincial approaches provided information on their work to support and assist trafficked persons. However, the provincial approaches provided evidence for being the overarching body to coordinate services to trafficking victims rather than being the front-line workers to actually provide the services directly to the victim:

> Our role is to coordinate services for victims of human trafficking, such as the provision of mental health/counselling … legal assistance, health care, interpretation … income support, rehabilitation/training and emergency shelter (ACT Representative 2015).

> We identify gaps and barriers that trafficked persons face, coordinate a network of response services for trafficked persons, and support communities to address [human trafficking] (OCTIP Representative 2015).

These approaches therefore act as the overarching coordinator to ensure that victims are receiving the appropriate services to meet their needs within individual communities throughout the province from community-based service providers. This differs from the findings provided in the above section relating to the Ontario community coalitions, who provided evidence of being the actual service providers to deliver services to the trafficking victims as front-line workers.

**P1 Protection Ontario & Provincial Approaches: b) Differences in Training Service Providers**
This study found mixed results between the provincial approaches under this indicator. Both Alberta’s ACT and BC’s OCTIP provided evidence of their work to train service providers on trafficking related issues. However, their approach to training service providers was substantially different. Alberta’s ACT provided a mandate very similar to the Ontario community coalitions’ in that it focused on training specific service providers on how to detect and respond to trafficking victims. As stated by ACT, their mandate includes “providing training and education to service providers” (ACT Representative 2015). By way of example, ACT provided a description of their work with Victim Service Units (VSUs) across the province of Alberta. According to ACT, VSUs are typically comprised of volunteers who support victims of crime, including sex trafficking. ACT has given presentations at VSU training sessions relating to human trafficking (ACT Representative 2015).

BC’s OCTIP provided a different view on training service providers, as their focus was on training service providers throughout the province for these services to then create their own individual coalition within the province of British Columbia. Specifically, OCTIP states as part of their work to “coordinate a network of response services for trafficked persons” and to “support communities to address this issue … we provide guidance and troubleshoot individual cases when needed” (OCTIP Representative 2015). OCTIP therefore seeks to provide individual communities with the tools to use their approach versus the approach used by ACT and Ontario coalitions’ to train individual service providers in responding to human trafficking.

Another way in which OCTIP differs from the other coalitions included in this study is in their training of service providers via the Internet. OCTIP created Canada’s
first online course that is designed to provide training on human trafficking to service providers, entitled “Human Trafficking: Canada is Not Immune” (OCTIP Representative 2015). This course is free and accessible anytime in French and English and ultimately aims to have individuals learn to “recognize, protect and assist a person who may have been trafficked” (OCTIP Representative 2015). Lastly, OCTIP has created a webinar for front-line service providers within government to be trained on trafficking related issues (OCTIP Representative 2015).

**P1 Protection Ontario & Provincial Approaches: c) Provincial Approaches Protect Vulnerable Populations**

Unlike any of the Ontario coalitions, the majority of the provincial approaches spoke directly about the need to protect vulnerable populations. One particular focus for these approaches was protecting First Nations people:

As part of our 10 Guiding Principles, we recognize the unique vulnerabilities of Aboriginal youth and women... As part of our priority focus, we aim to protect Aboriginal women and youth trafficked for sexual exploitation (OCTIP Representative 2015).

Human trafficking in the First Nations context is unique. First Nations women and girls are heavily targeted. They experience being “invisible” and devalued, and their self-worth, self-esteem and ability to have healthy relationships have been severely compromised by historical and inter-generational traumas and poverty (Tracia’s Trust Representative 2015).

With this, Manitoba’s approach presented their ‘Our Circle to Protect Sacred Lives’ project, which aims to, “build awareness and assist in developing plans based on cultural and community strengths to combat human trafficking” by having Manitoba’s First Nations communities directly respond to the trafficking of First Nations women and girls (Tracia’s Trust Representative 2015). At the time of this presentation, the project was in
its first phase, which included Tracia’s Trust working with 32 First Nation communities to further develop the project (Tracia’s Trust Representative 2015).

**P2 Prevention Ontario & Provincial Approaches**

The primary finding under the Prevention theme is that the included provincial approaches to respond to human trafficking focus on the implementation of practical prevention strategies within their given provinces much more than the Ontario coalitions. The results are provided below in figures 8 and 9.

*Figure 8*

*The following three items are indicators of a Prevention focus.*

---

**Results for Prevention (P2) Ontario and Provincial Approaches**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Information and Awareness</th>
<th>Practical Prevention Strategies</th>
<th>Reducing Vulnerabilities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>London</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>York</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alberta</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>British Columbia</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manitoba</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 9

The following provides a cumulative frequency for the four Ontario coalitions and three provincial models under the indicators with a Prevention focus.

Comparing Ontario Coalitions and Provincial Approaches for P2

As demonstrated in the above two figures, raising awareness and providing the public with information on human trafficking was the most referenced indicator for both the Ontario coalitions and provincial approaches. However, these figures also demonstrate a difference in references to practical prevention strategies and reducing vulnerabilities between these two forms of anti-trafficking approaches. These results are elaborated upon below.

**P2 Prevention Ontario & Provincial Approaches: a) Equal Representation of Information and Awareness Campaigns**

In this study, provincial approaches and Ontario community coalitions equally focused on information and awareness campaigns designed to inform and educate the public. However, one main distinction was in the form of information and awareness campaigns. As discussed above, the main form of information campaigns deployed by the
Ontario coalitions was via social media platforms, websites and/or brochures and posters. While all of the provincial approaches also provided evidence using these means to distribute information related to human trafficking, such as via their websites, the provincial approaches offered proof of distributing information through other means. For example, the Manitoba approach cited their ‘Stop Sex with Kids’ and ‘Youth Are Not Alone’ campaigns, which focus on raising awareness about the circumstances surrounding the sexual exploitation of children, and also the frequency with which this crime occurs (Tracia’s Trust Representative 2015). These campaigns are publicized on websites designed specifically for these campaigns in addition to advertising the campaigns via advertisements on the radio, television, billboards and transit stations strategically throughout Manitoba. Similarly, British Columbia’s OCTIP presented as an example their outreach materials entitled “We can help” and “Pocket Cards,” which seek to provide information/raise awareness about human trafficking and available help for trafficking victims. These outreach materials describe what OCTIP does throughout the province of British Columbia, and can be seen in Appendix F.

**P2 Prevention Ontario & Provincial Approaches: b) Provincial Approaches Provide More Evidence of Practical Prevention Strategies**

Unlike the Ontario coalitions, where only the coalition from York provided a practical prevention strategy during their presentation, the majority of the provincial approaches offered evidence of accomplishing this. For example, Manitoba provided six different strategies they have implemented, comprising of their Sex work Diversion Program, Sex work Offender Program, Outreach Services for residential childcare facilities, Our Circle to Protect Sacred Lives Project, their Child, Youth, Family and

---

2 See Appendix D for links.
Community Empowerment project and their StreetReach program (Tracia’s Trust Representative 2015). Similarly, BC’s OCTIP provided an example of their toolkit entitled “Communities Taking Action.” Within this toolkit are suggestions and step-by-step approaches for getting educated on human trafficking, and how to involve others within a given community. The toolkit seeks to support communities to create community responses to human trafficking – essentially a guide to creating a community coalition, similar to the Ontario coalitions. The presenter from BC reminded delegates that there was more information on this toolkit available on the OCTIP website (http://ccrweb.ca/en/octip-communities-taking-action-toolkit).

P2 Prevention Ontario & Provincial Approaches: c) Provincial Approaches Provide More Evidence to Reduce Vulnerabilities

While none of the Ontario coalitions included in this study provided evidence of attempts to reduce sex trafficking victim vulnerabilities, two of the three provincial approaches did. For example, as part of their StreetReach prevention strategy, Manitoba created a system to find ‘High Risk Victims’ (HRVs), which acknowledges that certain individuals are at a higher risk of becoming sex trafficking victims. This program attempts to reduce HRVs vulnerability to this sort of victimization by identifying potential victims early (Tracia’s Trust Representative 2015). Similarly, BC’s OCTIP provided as their focus to “build prevention in northern/rural parts of BC” as they discovered the individuals living in these areas (particularly First Nations people) were more susceptible to becoming victims of human trafficking (OCTIP Representative 2015).

P3 Prosecution Ontario & Provincial Approaches
Attempting to improve the detection of human trafficking and training law enforcement personnel were the most prevalent indicators of the Prosecution theme across provincial approaches. The results for this theme are illustrated in Figure 10.

**Figure 10**

*The following three items are indicators of a Prosecution focus.*

**Results for Prevention (P3) Ontario and Provincial Approaches**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Province</th>
<th>Training Criminal Justice Personnel</th>
<th>Supporting Investigations and Prosecutions</th>
<th>Improving Detection of Exploitation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>London</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>York</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alberta</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>British Columbia</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manitoba</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 11**

*The following provides a cumulative frequency for the four Ontario coalitions and three provincial models under the indicators with a Prosecution focus.*
As demonstrated in the two above figures, both the Ontario coalitions and provincial approaches mostly made reference to supporting investigations and prosecutions, however for the provincial approaches their focus on improving detection of exploitation was nearly as significant. These results are elaborated upon below.

**P3 Prosecution Ontario & Provincial Approaches: a) Provincial Approaches Provide Similar Training to Law Enforcement and Criminal Justice Officials**

This indicator provided similar findings as the Ontario coalitions in that all three provincial approaches provided evidence of training law enforcement and criminal justice officials on human trafficking. However, provincial approaches provided evidence of training on a larger scale as compared to the community-oriented training discussed by the Ontario coalitions:

we have a strong relationship with WPS [Winnipeg Police Services]. We train WPS on sex trafficking of children and work with the Counter Exploitation Unit of the WPS… and we also work with the Human Trafficking Coordinator of the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (Tracia’s Trust Representative 2015).
we struggled with the VPD [Vancouver Police Department] initially but we now find that the VPD are coming to us to ask questions related to human trafficking... we also train crown attorneys every year on human trafficking in BC (OCTIP Representative 2015).

As compared to the Ontario coalitions, these two provincial approaches provide evidence of not only working with their municipal policing partners, in the way the Ontario coalitions also provided, but also in working with Canada’s federal policing partner, the RCMP. Additionally, the discussion of providing training to crown attorneys in BC greatly differs from the clear frustrations discussed during the presentations of the Ontario community coalitions.

**P3 Prosecution Ontario & Provincial Approaches: b) Lack of Provincial Support for Investigations and Prosecutions**

Overall, the three provincial approaches did not provide as much evidence as the Ontario community coalitions to support investigations and prosecutions of traffickers. Mandates from all three of the provincial approaches made explicit mention of supporting investigations:

- Our goals as a response model include … rehabilitating or containing perpetrators [and] creating greater perpetrator accountability (Tracia’s Trust Representative 2015).

- We support law enforcement in identifying victims of trafficking and laying charges (ACT Representative 2015).

However, it was only BC’s OCTIP that provided actual evidence of methods used to support investigations and prosecutions in a similar manner as the Ontario coalitions:

- We provide court support to victims throughout the prosecution process [and] we work with the RCMP Human Trafficking Coordinator and local police on individual cases (OCTIP Representative 2015).

Aside from the fact that OCTIP works with their federal policing partners in the RCMP, which was not discussed by any of the Ontario coalitions, the actual act of providing
support to victims throughout the prosecution process was identical as the typical form of support demonstrated by the Ontario coalitions.

**P3 Prosecution Ontario & Provincial Approaches: c) Provinces Provide Greater Focus on Improving Detection of Trafficking**

Overall, the provincial approaches provided more concrete evidence of their work to improve the detection of trafficking as compared to the Ontario community coalitions. As provided earlier, none of the Ontario coalitions included in this study provided evidence of improving detection of human trafficking cases for the purpose of improving the prosecution of the traffickers – instead the coalitions largely focused on improving the detection of trafficking instances for the purpose of providing assistance to the trafficking victim. However, by contrast, all three of the provincial approaches provided evidence of attempting to improve the detection of traffickers:

We have created an outreach handbook called ‘What can you do,’ which was designed for the average community member to detect human trafficking. This includes tips such as... reporting human trafficking. We don’t want them to intervene, as this can be very dangerous in human trafficking cases. Instead, we want them to report suspected cases to the police. But if they won’t go to the police, at least now they can come to ACT to report human trafficking (ACT Representative 2015).

How you can help ... contact police if a child or youth has run away, is missing, or if you suspect they are being exploited. Let the police know if you have heard about or seen a pimp or recruiter operating your community... If you know an adult who is involved in an exploitative relationship with a young person, do not remain silent. Call the police and report the offence (OCTIP Booklet 2015).

Similarly, Manitoba’s approach provided evidence on their work to improve detection of exploitation through their StreetReach program. Specifically, the presenter from Manitoba explained how individuals involved in StreetReach worked to develop tools to intervene with predators and sexually exploited children. In doing so, StreetReach
increased the number of criminal charges of offenders, thereby statistically improving the
detection of trafficking instances in Manitoba (Tracia’s Trust Representative 2015).

**P4 Partnerships Provincial and Ontario Approaches**

Overall, the theme of partnerships was discussed in similar terms by the
provincial approaches as compared to the Ontario community coalitions in that all three
of the provinces stressed this as an essential component of their approach. The main
difference in comparing the two approaches is that the provinces provided more evidence
of being involved in informing policy responses to human trafficking. The results of this
theme are presented below and in *Figure 12*.

*Figure 12*

*The following three items are indicators of a Partnerships focus.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Province</th>
<th>Enhance Engagement and Collaboration</th>
<th>Inform Policy Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>London</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>York</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alberta</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>British Columbia</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manitoba</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The following provides a cumulative frequency for the four Ontario coalitions and three provincial models under the indicators with a Partnerships focus.

As demonstrated in the above two figures, both the provincial approaches and Ontario coalitions primarily made reference to enhancing engagement and collaboration. However, while the Ontario coalitions did not make reference to any work to inform policy responses, the provincial approaches did provide evidence of doing so. The results are elaborated upon below.

**P4 Partnerships Provincial and Ontario Approaches: a) Equal Focus on Enhanced Engagement and Collaboration and Action Toward Informing Policy**

All three of the provincial approaches included in their presentation aspects on the importance of engaging service providers and having those service providers collaborate on addressing human trafficking. To illustrate the importance of this, Alberta’s ACT
provided the following example of a sex trafficking case that took place in Edmonton, Alberta:

We had a case where an Edmonton woman had a friend who contacted her to tell her she can make money as a sex worker. Her friend arranges her travel to northern Alberta but once she’s up north, she was coerced into performing sex acts she was uncomfortable with and was forced to relinquish her earnings. With this sort of case, we look at our three pillars [prevent, prosecute and protect] and determine if we can act on all three. If we can’t then we consult with our partners to make sure the victim gets what she needs (ACT Representative 2015).

This is similar to the Ontario coalitions perspective on the importance of using partnerships to achieve the goals of preventing, prosecuting and protecting those involved in human trafficking cases. Where the provinces differ from the Ontario community coalitions is in their ability to work on a larger scale. These provinces described their approach as an overarching body for the province as a whole, under which falls the work of individual communities throughout their individual provinces:

ACT is an umbrella group that provides services all across the province. We look to coordinate the services for human trafficking cases across Alberta (ACT Representative 2015).

We coordinate a network of response services for trafficked persons and support communities to address this issue … and the coordination role is key. We have to build local capacity in order to achieve our goals (OCTIP Representative 2015).

We have developed 12 provincial sexual exploitation regional teams, which coordinate awareness/prevention initiatives to address sexual exploitation/human trafficking unique to their region. These are like the coalitions in Ontario (Tracia’s Trust Representative 2015).

In a sense, the provinces provided evidence of their role to act in a liaison capacity that works amongst service providers in order to coordinate and help individual communities within their province mobilize to work against sex trafficking, and to help trafficking victims. The work done by the individual communities can be seen as equivalent to those
being done by the Ontario coalitions within their municipalities (Tracia’s Trust Representative 2015; OCTIP Representative 2015).

**P4 Partnerships Provincial and Ontario Approaches: b) Provinces Inform Policy**

As demonstrated in *Figure 12*, all three of the provincial approaches discussed their work to inform policy responses. This greatly differs from the Ontario coalitions, who did not provide any concrete evidence of their work to inform policy. For instance, Manitoba provided the following evidence of their accomplishments in informing policy within their province:

> We helped to create criminal property forfeiture legislation where the police have the right to seize places from the owner of that property where sexual exploitation of children is occurring… we’ve worked on legislation that would allow victims of child sexual abuse, and potentially one day adults, to sue their perpetrators for damage in civil court (Tracia’s Trust Representative 2015).

In addition to informing policy at the provincial level, the approaches from BC and Alberta also provided evidence of informing national policy:

> One of our current projects is conducting research on Canada Border Services Agency (CBSA) and immigration. We want to work with our immigration counterparts to better understand how we can work with them to detect and prevent human trafficking. And yes we have communicated with them on this and they are eager to work with us (ACT Representative 2015).

> The B.C. Action Plan sets out both short and long term actions to address human trafficking … Priority Action number 5 is to increase research, policy and legislative responses to human trafficking in B.C. [OCTIP] contribute information and participate in consultations on trafficking to further inform the development of the [Canada] National Action Plan to Combat Human Trafficking (OCTIP Handout 2015).

In summary, the analysis conducted on the collected data indicated many similarities and differences between the Ontario community coalitions and provincial approaches. The data analyzed for the theme of protection indicated that all of the
approaches included in this study place a large emphasis on providing services to victims, however the community coalitions indicated conducting more front-line work. And, while all of the approaches provided evidence of attempting to prevent the crime of sex trafficking from occurring, their work to do so varies significantly. In addition, the provincial approaches reported a much stronger involvement in improving the detection of trafficking for the purpose of pursuing a prosecution. Lastly, the theme of partnerships illuminated a stark contrast in the provincial approaches’ ability to inform policy related to sex trafficking in Canada. The following chapter will provide a more in-depth analysis of these similarities and differences, with the added context of how this analysis fits contextually into existing academic literature on these subjects.
Chapter Five: Discussion

The primary objective of this research study was to examine how community coalitions in Ontario work to address human trafficking within their given jurisdiction. The secondary objective was to compare these community coalitions to provincial approaches that exist in Canada. This research adds to a limited body of research that examines approaches focused on addressing sex trafficking among all other forms of human trafficking. This chapter will discuss the two research objectives of this study through the theoretical lens of feminist criminology and community psychology in relation to existing literature on sex trafficking and responses to this crime. Thereafter, this chapter will discuss implications based on the findings of this current research. The chapter will conclude with an outline of the limitations of this research and provide avenues for future research on this topic.

Examining Ontario Community Coalitions

The current research study sought to examine Ontario community coalitions and understand how these community-based approaches address sex trafficking within their given jurisdiction. These findings indicate that while some of the coalitions explicitly based their approach on what is known as the four P’s (prevention, prosecution, protection and partnership), others, possibly unknowingly, did so by creating their approach in a way that attends to these four pillars (Public Safety Canada 2016, U.S. Department of State 2016). This research study found that community coalitions in Ontario could be defined as inter-agency coalitions formed between governmental and non-governmental organizations that work to prevent the occurrence of sex trafficking, prosecute those responsible for committing the crime, and also protect trafficking victims.
These community coalitions rely on building partnerships between agencies in order to achieve these goals. The next portion of this chapter will provide a discussion and critical analysis of the results outlined in chapter four as it relates to my theoretical perspectives and existing academic literature.

**Protecting Trafficking Victims**

As provided in chapter three, the results of this study demonstrated all of the approaches included in this study provided evidence of supporting and assisting trafficked persons. This is an essential component to any approach responding to sex trafficking, due to the significant needs of sex trafficking victims (Oxman-Martinez, Lacroix and Hanley 2005; Jones 2009; Macy and Johns 2011; Hodge 2014; Office for Victims of Crime 2014). Under the community psychology perspective, this would be considered essential for any approach to consider as this perspective emphasizes the importance of social systems, such as a community coalition or provincial approach, coming together to empower an individual within their environment.

Another important aspect under the protection theme was the protection of vulnerable populations. This research found that provincial approaches exhibit more concrete evidence of attempting this as compared to the Ontario coalitions, such as in their work to protect First Nations people. As provided in the existing literature and under the feminist criminological framework, it is essential for a coalition to use an intersectional lens when considering the vulnerabilities that exist toward possible victims of sex trafficking, whereby you consider an individual’s race/ethnicity/culture, gender and class (Crenshaw 1999; Samarasinghe and Burton 2007; Berger and Guidroz 2009;
Canada Women’s Foundation 2013; Crawford 2017). In a Canadian context this is an important aspect for coalitions to provide, given the most likely group to be targeted for recruitment into sex trafficking are those that are impoverished, female and of a marginalized race or ethnicity, such as a significant number of First Nations women in Canada (Oxman-Martinez, Lacroix and Hanley 2005; Barrett 2010; McIntyre 2012; Canada Women’s Foundation 2013; Public Safety Canada 2016; Louie 2017). Programs such as Manitoba’s ‘Restoring the Sacred’ and ‘Our Circle to Protect Sacred Lives’ attempt to accomplish this, as they both focus on preventing trafficking victimization for First Nations women and girls. It therefore appears that the provincial approaches are providing more work in protecting vulnerable populations when compared with the community coalitions.

One aspect that was not highlighted by any of the coalitions or provincial approaches was the use of a simultaneously trauma-informed and victim-centred approach when supporting trafficking victims. As discussed in chapter 2, the existing research on assisting trafficking victims posits that service providers must deliver services with an understanding of how trauma can affect an individual, while also ensuring the victim and their needs remain at the centre of the services being delivered (Gabriele et al. 2014; Hodge 2014; Orme and Ross-Sheriff 2015; Weissbecker and Clark 2007; Macy and Johns 2011; Hardy, Compton and McPhatter 2013; Hammond and McGlone 2014; Sapiro et al. 2016; Hopper 2017). While the findings of this research did demonstrate that the Ontario coalitions in particular maintain a focus of using the victim-centred approach, there was no evidence provided of simultaneously using a trauma-informed approach.
Preventing Sex Trafficking

One of the major findings of this research under the theme of prevention was that all of the anti-human trafficking coalitions/approaches attempt to prevent sex trafficking through education and information campaigns, mainly via social media or the Internet. These information campaigns are largely designed to educate the public on the crime of human trafficking and also to prevent further victimization by providing potential indicators that someone is being trafficked so as to improve the detection of victimization. Spreading awareness is supported by existing literature, as research has demonstrated the effectiveness in preventing sex trafficking through public education (Mameli 2002; Reynolds 2011; Task Force on Trafficking of Women and Girls 2014; Public Safety Canada 2016). Indeed, Samarasinghe and Burton (2007) and Sigmon (2008) maintain that spreading awareness in this manner is particularly necessary when dealing with an inherently misunderstood crime, such as sex trafficking. Moreover, as stated by Oxman-Martinez, Lacroix and Hanley (2005), it is important to raise awareness and educate those deemed at-risk that they are susceptible to becoming a victim of sex trafficking so as to try and prevent these future victimizations from occurring.

One of the major differences found between the community and provincial approaches in this study was in the provinces’ work to prevent human trafficking in a more practical way in the implementation of practical prevention strategies within their province. This was not the case for any of the community coalitions, aside from the coalition from York, who provided evidence of one practical prevention strategy where they have survivors of sex trafficking provide presentations in schools to educate young boys and girls on the topic. This form of prevention is supported by existing research,
which has highlighted the necessity to educate purchasers of sex trafficking, which are overwhelmingly men, as it ensures they better understand the potential harm involved in this act (Mameli 2002; Yen 2008; Walker 2013; Wilson, Critelli and Rittner 2015). Moreover, it is important to educate young women on the topic of sex trafficking to try and prevent further victimization (Oxman-Martinez, Lacroix and Hanley 2005; Samarasinghe and Burton 2007; McIntyre 2012; Canada Women’s Foundation 2013). When using a feminist criminology lens to examine these results, this framework would contend that prevention strategies need to consider the patriarchal structures currently in place within Canadian society as these structures make women more susceptible to becoming victims of crime. York’s work to intervene with boys at an early age could help to eradicate these patriarchal structures, given that this early intervention could help these boys and eventual men to work against rather than reinforce the patriarchal values in society that lead to women becoming sex trafficking victims.

Interestingly, what was not highlighted by any of the coalitions/approaches was the need to educate the public on indicators of recruitment. While the information campaigns certainly contain components of this, such as providing indicators of sex trafficking, there was no focus placed upon the need to inform the public on typical forms of recruitment techniques, such as the love or debt approaches outlined in chapter two (Kennedy et al. 2007; Wilson and Dalton 2008; Kotrala 2010; Walker 2013; Beeson 2015; Crawford 2017). This appears to be a major gap in the coalitions’ responses to sex trafficking, given the importance of educating potential victims on recruitment techniques typically used to lure victims into the control of the trafficker(s) (Sigmon 2008;

**Prosecuting Traffickers**

Overall, this study found many similarities in the provincial and community coalitions’ work to prosecute traffickers, such as their similar work in providing training to law enforcement personnel. This is a necessary step toward prosecuting sex trafficking cases (Oxman-Martinez, Hanley and Lacroix 2005; Wilson and Dalton 2008; Brown 2011; Public Safety and 2016; Roberson 2017). Wilson and Dalton state “even though human trafficking is a growing global concern, it is ultimately a problem identified locally” (2008, 297). It is therefore essential that local police be trained to detect and deal with sex trafficking cases in order to identify cases which are thereafter prosecuted in a court of law.

One major difference between the community and provincial approaches was in their work to provide support to victims throughout the criminal justice process. Trafficking victims often face various fears after their victimization, including a fear of authorities (Sigmon 2008; Barrett 2010; Brown 2011; Canada Women’s Foundation 2013). Moreover, victims can face re-victimization during the criminal justice process and service providers involved in the community coalitions can provide assistance to these victims throughout this process in order to deal with their trauma in a healthy manner (Sigmon 2008; Barrett 2010). It is therefore essential that anti-trafficking approaches provide this form of assistance to trafficking victims. This appears to be a gap in two of the three provincial approaches, with only BC’s OCTIP providing evidence of accomplishing this goal.
Another distinction discovered between the provincial and community-based coalitions was the provincial approaches’ evidence of attempting to improve the detection of sex trafficking for the purpose of pursuing a prosecution. This was not discovered in the results of the community coalitions data, despite research indicating the importance of doing so (Sigmon 2008; Barrett 2010; Gabriele et al. 2014; Department of Justice 2015). As stated by much of the research on sex trafficking, this is a severely undetected and underreported crime (Sigmon 2008; Barrett 2010; Verhoeven and Gestel 2011; Canada Women’s Foundation 2013; Karlsson 2013; Walker 2013; Gabriele et al. 2014; Public Safety Canada 2016). It is therefore essential that any approach attempting to address sex trafficking include as part of their action plan to detect the crime when it is occurring, and ultimately contain the perpetrator. Overall, the provincial approaches provided concrete examples of their work with law enforcement and criminal justice personnel to improve the detection of trafficking occurrences.

**Building Partnerships**

This research found that all of the coalitions/approaches involved in the study placed an emphasis on building and maintaining relationships between agencies in order to respond effectively to sex trafficking. Specifically, these coalitions/approaches placed a large emphasis on enhancing collaboration and engagement between the organizations in the response model. This is consistent with existing literature on the effectiveness of partnerships in a coalition/approach, as previous research has demonstrated that coalitions working in the realm of violence against women can facilitate relationships that lead toward a more natural flow of exchange between partners, thereby enhancing collaboration among stakeholders (Foster-Fishman et al. 2001; Allen, Watt and Hess
Moreover, existing research, including research included in the community psychology framework, indicates that in enhancing collaboration and engagement, coalitions can promote knowledge across fields of expertise in their response, and can also create institutionalized change (Lasker and Weiss 2003; Salzer et al. 2007; Allen, Watt and Hess 2008; Javdani and Allen 2001; McCoy et al. 2017). Both provincial and community coalitions placed an emphasis on creating institutionalized change as a result of these partnerships, albeit in slightly different ways. For the community coalitions, the main focus of their approach was overwhelmingly placed on the trafficking victims. Their focus for creating institutionalized change was on a more local level with the focus being to better the experience of the trafficking victim after their victimization has occurred. This is an important component of any approach. As provided in chapter two when examining the community coalitions responding to health-related matters, community coalitions are best placed to directly provide resources to the victim due to the relationships built between the various experts, perspectives and resources of the participating agencies (Trinh-Shevrin et al. 2011; Bailey et al. 2011; Reed et al. 2014). In this way, community coalitions can act as a guide for the victim to ensure that no aspect of their recovery is overlooked (Robinson 2006; Shorey, Tirone and Stuart 2014; Greeson and Campbell 2015). It appears that this is being accomplished via the strong partnerships and collaboration between members of the community coalitions.

In contrast, the provincial approaches demonstrated their ability to create institutionalized change with their partnerships on a more macro-level, such as through informing policy. As presented in the results of this research, all three of the provincial
approaches in this study provided evidence of informing policy within their provinces and on a national scale. The policy discussed at the conference focused largely on the area of prosecution, such as Alberta’s work with Canada Border Services Agency (CBSA), BC’s work with the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP), and Manitoba’s work to create a specialized sexual exploitation and trafficking investigator. This form of cooperation between governmental and non-governmental agencies is a key component to creating institutionalized change in the form of increasing the prosecution of what has been established as a difficult crime to both detect and prosecute (Barrett 2010; Campbell, Patterson and Bybee 2011; Canada Women’s Foundation 2013; Walker 2013; Shorey, Tirone and Stuart 2014; Peters 2015; Greeson and Campbell 2015). While the provincial approaches are more capable of producing change through macro-level methods, the Ontario community coalitions were stronger at producing similar change on a micro-level with a focus on the individual victim.

**Conclusion**

This research study focused on answering two research questions. First, this study focused on understanding and examining the function of local community coalitions in Ontario that work to respond to human trafficking. Additionally, this study focused on comparing and contrasting these local coalitions with wider anti-trafficking provincial approaches based in Western Canada. This research study ultimately found many similarities, and many key differences between these two forms of anti-trafficking approaches. In this concluding section of this research, implications of the data collection and subsequent analysis will be provided, followed by how this research contributes to the existing literature that exists on the two theories used to frame this
study, that being feminist criminology and community psychology. Following this, limitations of the research design are identified. Lastly, this study will conclude with a discussion on future research that could be conducted based on what was discovered in this study.

**Implications**

The current research study has found existing strengths and gaps in the community coalitions and provincial approaches examined. In doing so, this research has found the two forms of approaches to be largely complimentary in nature. Canadian provinces certainly benefit from having a provincial approach in place, as this larger body of organizations working together is more capable of providing influence and change toward larger scale projects, such as the prevention and/or prosecution of sex trafficking. In contrast, the local community coalitions provided strengths in more locally focused projects, such as providing direct services to trafficking victims, and providing specialized training to local law enforcement. As defined in chapter two, institutionalized change is defined as any change demonstrated in either the victim’s experience or the prosecution or prevention of the specific crime being focused on (Sullivan and Bybee 1999; Allen, Watt and Hess 2008; McCoy et al. 2017). This research therefore provides an outline for provinces in Canada to consider when responding to sex trafficking by incorporating both provincial and community-based approaches to effectively prosecute traffickers, protect trafficking victims, and prevent the crime from occurring altogether.

This research has also highlighted gaps in existing community and provincially based approaches. It is evident from this research that although the concept of a coalition remains the same throughout the seven included in this study, with a focus on
collaboration between governmental and non-governmental agencies, no two coalitions are directly alike. This research can therefore influence the development of any future community or provincial approach. This research can also provide direct analysis for the coalitions involved in this research to better understand the existing gaps in their work and response models they create.

**Contribution to Existing Literature**

This research study contributes to the sociological and criminological research that currently exists on sex trafficking, and more broadly on violence against women (VAW). For the most part, VAW research has focused on intimate partner violence and sexual assault. However, this research has highlighted the similarities in responding to these crimes as compared to sex trafficking, particularly as this crime involves what is often a male trafficker exerting power and manipulation over his likely female victim (Winterdyk, Perrin and Reichel 2012; Gabriele et al. 2014; United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime 2016). This research therefore provides a link between responses to sex trafficking and other crimes concerning VAW at the community and provincial level in Canada. Moreover, this research adds to a limited body of research on Canadian approaches to human trafficking.

In addition, this study has reinforced the use of a feminist criminology perspective during analysis. Feminist criminology posits that researchers must not examine a female victim relative to her male counterpart (Daly and Chesney-Lind 1988; Flavin 2001; Burgess-Proctor 2006; Chesney-Lind and Morash 2013). Instead, the female victim must be considered as a whole, with the added perspective of using an intersectional lens to fully understand the female victim’s experience (Burgess-Proctor 2006; Chesney-Lind
and Morash 2013). This research has therefore added to this existing literature in that it has discussed victims of sex trafficking, both pre- and post-recruitment, in the context of how women are typically involved in this crime. This research did not compare these female victims to male victims of violent crimes, and instead illuminated the necessity of considering a female victim and all of her identities when providing a response to her victimization. Moreover, this research has placed an emphasis on considering how a potential victim’s vulnerability increases the more aligned she becomes with the targeted vulnerabilities of being impoverished and of a minority race.

This research has also reinforced the use of the community psychology theoretical framework to examine social systems instituted to work toward a common goal, which in this case was effectively responding to human trafficking. As outlined in chapter two, the theory of community psychology places an emphasis on having a multi-dimensional framework that works toward the common goal of helping disempowered individuals (Levine et al. 2005; Wolff 2014). A particular focus on creating institutionalized change was provided by both the community and provincial response approaches. Within the community psychology theory, change and empowerment are considered essential for any framework to usurp as a common goal to affect progress with a specific social challenge, such as the crime of sex trafficking (Peirson, Boydell, Ferguson and Ferris 2011; Wolff 2014). This focus on empowering individuals to create change was observed on a micro- and macro-level in this research, with the community coalitions focusing on creating micro-level changes in the experience of trafficking victims, and the provincial approaches focusing on creating macro-level changes to further the prosecution of traffickers, and prevent the crime of sex trafficking.


**Limitations**

Despite the strengths of this research, this study has limitations. The most significant limitation of this research was previously outlined in chapter 3 when discussing the methodology used to collect this data. In addition to this limitation, there is a limitation in the generalizability of this information across Canada. This sample was dependent upon who was invited to present at the conference attended, and did not include any representation from the eastern part of Canada, including the province of Quebec. It is therefore unclear if the eastern regions of Canada operate in similar manners when responding to sex trafficking. One other significant limitation of this study is that it speaks to the needs of sex trafficking victims and the services provided to them without including a firsthand account from a sex trafficking victim and their experience with the community and provincially based coalitions.

**Future Research**

The current study has provided a useful examination of the work being done by four community coalitions in Ontario and three provincial approaches based in Western Canada. One of the main findings of this research was the complimentary nature of these community and provincially based coalitions. Therefore, future research could consider examining the implementation of a provincial approach in Ontario, or in other provinces in Canada. With this, future research could also attempt to measure how effective these approaches are in accomplishing the work they claim to do. Most importantly, future research should consider a victim’s view of how effective their interactions have been with the existing community and provincially based coalitions. In doing so, future research could identify gaps in services received by trafficking victims. Lastly, another
area for future research to focus on is to provide information on recruitment techniques. As noted in this chapter, despite the widespread discussion in existing literature on the typical techniques used to recruit sex trafficking victims, there was little mention of these techniques at the conference. Future research could therefore attempt to identify if these community and provincial sex trafficking response models are indeed focusing on these techniques, or if other techniques exist in Canada.
Reference List


Flick, Uwe. 2007. Designing Qualitative Research. London: SAGE Publications Ltd.


Appendix A: Descriptions of Ontario coalitions and Provincial Response Models

Ottawa Coalition to End Human Trafficking

The Ottawa Coalition to End Human Trafficking (OCEHT) provides services for individuals in the Ottawa region. As presented at the conference, this approach is a “community-based network of local organizations, service providers and community members, working on a volunteer basis towards the rescue and recovery of victims of human trafficking” (OCEHT Representative, Summer Conference on Human Trafficking 2015). Within the coalition they have three permanent partners – St. Joe’s Women’s Centre, Ottawa Police Service (Human Trafficking Unit and Victim Crisis Unit) and the Persons Against the Crime of Trafficking in Humans (PACT-Ottawa). The coalition conference presenter explained that OCEHT was originally a committee of service providers within PACT-Ottawa that separated into an independent coalition in order to have a coalition more focused on providing services to victims of human trafficking above all else in the Ottawa area, leaving PACT-Ottawa to focus more on other aspects of addressing human trafficking, such as creating and implementing preventative measures. OCEHT has other partners they work with on a case-by-case basis, but at the time of this conference it was explained they are still a relatively new coalition gaining traction to find more permanent partners.

Coalition Assisting Trafficked Individuals

The Coalition Assisting Trafficked Individuals (CATI) provides services to the London-Middlesex region of Ontario. CATI is a coalition comprised of 16 agencies and seven individual community members. This coalition aims to “provide services for trafficked individuals, conduct research, provide education and training, and form
alliances with local, national and international groups addressing human trafficking” (CATI Representative, 2015). Within this is a Steering Committee that meets more frequently than the general members of the coalition. This Committee includes immigration officers, union representatives, shelter representatives, local police, First Nations services and language services. The Steering Committee is divided into seven sections with different responsibilities. These sections are fundraising, shelter, volunteers, protocols, communications, data collection and a project manager who is responsible for providing training to agencies or departments who need training relating to human trafficking.

**Toronto Counter Human Trafficking Network (FCJ Refugee Centre)**

A representative from the Faithful Companions of Jesus (FCJ) Refugee Centre presented the anti-human trafficking model for Toronto. The FCJ Refugee Centre created the Toronto Counter Human Trafficking Network (TCHTN) in order to provide services to human trafficking victims in the Greater Toronto Area. The presentation of this approach focused solely on TCTHN’s response model for adult human trafficking. The mandate of TCHTN is to eliminate human trafficking in Canada and abroad by raising awareness of the extent of human trafficking, facilitating assistance to trafficked persons, building capacity among stakeholders, collaborating with key stakeholders and networks, and lastly through fundraising. The exact organization of TCHTN was not discussed at the conference, however it was indicated that it is made up of various employees, volunteers and outside agencies/organizations working together in a collaborative manner.

**York Region Anti-Human Trafficking Committee**
The York Region Anti-Human Trafficking Committee (YRAHTC) is a community coalition that serves solely women and girls in the York region of Ontario. YRAHTC described itself as an anti-oppressive, non-judgemental, feminist organization that is working toward the elimination of human trafficking and exploitation in the York region. This community coalition unites 33 stakeholders, including representation from the fields of criminal justice, faith-based organizations, social services and child protection, as well as an elected official and an educational institution. YRAHTC also works closely with survivors of human trafficking when creating their protocols and/or projects to work toward their mandate.

**Action Coalition on Human Trafficking**

The Action Coalition on Human Trafficking (ACT) is an approach that works to combat and respond to human trafficking throughout the province of Alberta. As presented at the conference, ACT works to, “increase knowledge and awareness on human trafficking, advocate for effective rights based responses, build capacity of all involved stakeholders, and lead and foster collaboration for joint action against human trafficking” (ACT Representative 2015). ACT is comprised of an Executive Director, a President, co-ordinators, a research consultant, regional coordinators and five directors that specialize in various disciplines. As examples, ACT stated that they have directors in the field of business, law and academia. The representative from this coalition explained that ACT has specific priority areas, including developing programs, communication and collaboration, developing funds, and dealing with emerging issues and/or proposals put forward from within or to the coalition as they pertain to the eradication of human trafficking in Alberta.
British Columbia’s Office to Combat Trafficking in Persons

British Columbia’s Office to Combat Trafficking in Persons (OCTIP) was the approach presented at the conference for British Columbia (BC). This presentation was unique, in that it is a coalition that works out of a provincial government office. OCTIP started as an independent office before integrating into the Community Safety and Crime Prevention Branch within British Columbia’s Ministry of Justice. With this move into the provincial government, OCTIP became ultimately responsible for the overall coordination of BC’s strategy to address human trafficking. As presented at the conference, the mandate of OCTIP is to, “identify gaps and barriers that trafficked persons face, coordinate a network of response services for trafficked persons, support communities to address this issue, and to contribute to national and international efforts to prevent and eliminate human trafficking” (OCTIP Representative 2015). OCTIP is comprised of 130 participants representing large non-governmental organizations, police, Crown representatives, victim services, academics, faith-based organizations and representatives from the First Nations community.

Manitoba’s Tracia’s Trust

The approach presented at the conference on behalf of Manitoba was Tracia’s Trust, which focuses exclusively on sexual exploitation of children. As explained by the presenter, this model first launched in December of 2002 after grassroots models such as those discussed above in the form of Ontario community coalitions came together and pushed for a unified, provincial model to be in place throughout Manitoba. The mandate of Tracia’s Trust is to be a, “multi-jurisdictional and coordinated governmental and community approach to preventing or addressing the incidence of the sexual exploitation
of children, youth and adults in Manitoba” (Manitoba Representative, Summer Conference on Human Trafficking 2015). This model was implemented throughout the province of Manitoba and as a result, a separate office for sexual exploitation and trafficking of children was created. This response model falls under the provincial government’s Department of Family Services.
Appendix B: The Codebook

Prevention

**Code:** Information and Awareness

**Short Definition:** Raising awareness and spreading information

**Full Definition:** In order to prevent the crime of human trafficking, coalitions/approaches must provide information to the public about the crime and/or their efforts toward preventing this crime. This includes raising awareness about the occurrence of human trafficking within their jurisdiction and defining what entails an incident of human trafficking.

**When to Use:** Apply this code to all references to coalition efforts toward raising awareness about the crime of human trafficking. Also apply to all references to coalition efforts toward providing information about human trafficking and/or their efforts to prevent the crime from occurring.

**Code:** Practical Strategies

**Short Definition:** Practical Prevention Strategies

**Full Definition:** In order to prevent human trafficking, concrete prevention strategies must be implemented to actively combat the crime. This code looks for practical/concrete prevention strategies created and implemented by coalitions/approaches in order to prevent human trafficking from occurring in their jurisdiction.

**When to Use:** Apply this code to all references to concrete, practical prevention strategies that have been created by the Ontario coalition/provincial approaches. These strategies can either be currently implemented, implemented in the past, or will be implemented in the future.

**Code:** Reduce Vulnerabilities

**Short Definition:** Reducing Vulnerabilities

**Full Definition:** In order to prevent an individual from becoming a victim of human trafficking, coalition/approaches should attempt to reduce common vulnerabilities seen across past victims. Recognizing and reducing these common vulnerabilities can prevent an individual from becoming a victim of human trafficking.
When to Use: Apply this code to all references to coalition efforts to reduce specific vulnerabilities in the population of their jurisdiction that are tied with victimization of human trafficking.

**Protection**

**Code:** Train Service Providers

**Short Definition:** Train Traditional and Non-Traditional Service Providers

**Full Definition:** In order for service providers to understand how to protect or respond to victims of human trafficking they must first be trained by those who understand the crime and the effect it can have on an individual. Providing topic-specific training to service providers about human trafficking is a necessary component of delivering essential services to these victims.

**When to Use:** Apply this code to all references to a coalition/approaches’ efforts to train service providers about human trafficking and/or how to appropriately respond to victims of this crime. This code may apply to training of traditional service providers working in the social services field, and non-traditional service providers.

**Code:** Support and Assist Victims

**Short Definition:** Support and Assist Trafficked Individuals

**Full Definition:** Once a victim of human trafficking has been identified there are many different services that she or he will likely need, and many needs that will need attending to. Anti-trafficking approaches should attempt to offer their support and/or assistance to victims.

**When to Use:** Apply this code to all references to a coalition/approaches’ efforts to provide support and/or assistance to a victim of human trafficking. This can apply to any references toward supporting and/or assisting a victim that is currently being trafficked or has been trafficked previously.

**Code:** Protect Vulnerable Populations

**Short Definition:** Protect Vulnerable Populations

**Full Definition:** Certain populations in Canada have been identified as being particularly susceptible to becoming victims of human trafficking. Anti-trafficking approaches should
attempt to protect those populations that are known to be particularly vulnerable to becoming victims of human trafficking.

**When to Use:** Apply this code to all references to a coalition/approaches’ efforts to protect vulnerable populations. This can apply to any reference to protecting an individual that is either currently being trafficked or is particularly vulnerable to becoming a victim.

---

**Prosecution**

**Code:** Train Law Enforcement

**Short Definition:** Train Law Enforcement and Criminal Justice Officials

**Full Definition:** Anti-trafficking approaches should offer training to any and all law enforcement and/or officials working in the criminal justice system. This training may include learning how to identify victims/perpetrators of human trafficking or how best to handle a case of human trafficking once it is discovered.

**When to Use:** Apply this code to all references of a coalition/approaches’ efforts to provide training or instruction to law enforcement and/or personnel working the criminal justice system. This code applies to any form of training or instruction provided.

---

**Code:** Supporting Investigations

**Short Definition:** Support Investigations and Prosecutions

**Full Definition:** Anti-trafficking approaches should work in conjunction with law enforcement and other criminal justice officials in order to support any investigations and/or prosecutions of human trafficking cases. As the approaches are mainly comprised of service providers in the social services field, they often provide advice, information or emotional support to the victim and the criminal justice officials involved in the given case.

**When to Use:** Apply this code to all references of a coalition/approaches’ efforts to support criminal investigations and/or prosecutions of human trafficking perpetrators. This code applies to efforts to support the victim during the criminal trial should they testify as a witness in court. This code also applies to attempts to recognize and bridge the gap between law enforcement and trafficking victims as these victims typically have a serious mistrust of law enforcement officials.

---

**Code:** Improve Detection
**Short Definition:** Improving Detection of Trafficking

**Full Definition:** In order for perpetrators of human trafficking to be prosecuted, they must first be detected. Anti-trafficking approaches work in conjunction with law enforcement and other criminal justice officials to detect instances of exploitation of trafficking victims for the purpose of pursuing a prosecution.

**When to Use:** Apply this code to all references of a coalition/approaches’ efforts to detect instances of human trafficking for the purpose of obtaining the trafficker to be prosecuted in a court of law. This includes efforts to improve the likelihood of detecting exploitation, or assisting law enforcement/criminal justice officials in their efforts to detect human trafficking cases.

---

**Partnerships**

**Code:** Enhance Collaboration

**Short Definition:** Enhance Engagement and Collaboration Among Parties

**Full Definition:** Anti-trafficking approaches observed in this research were comprised of many individuals, agencies and/or organizations that work together to respond effectively to human trafficking. Part of their design is to engage and collaborate with the various parties/members.

**When to Use:** Apply this code to all references of a coalition/approaches’ effort to engage and/or collaborate in order to respond to human trafficking in their jurisdiction. This code applies to efforts to engage/collaborate within their coalition, or with other individuals, agencies and/or organizations that are not directly a part of the model but still work in the field of human trafficking.

---

**Code:** Inform Policy

**Short Definition:** Inform Policy Responses

**Full Definition:** When working with partners involved in the government at any level (municipal, provincial and/or federal) an anti-trafficking approach should aid in the development or alterations of existing policy relating to human trafficking. Coalitions are able to aid in policy development as the inclusion of various agencies/organizations from various perspectives (law enforcement, social services, etc.) brings together interdisciplinary, multi-focused information that can be useful in understanding human trafficking and how best to respond to this crime.
**When to Use:** Apply this code to all references of a coalition/approaches’ efforts to inform policy responses. This can be policy developed at the municipal, provincial or federal level of government relating to human trafficking. This code can also be applied for plans to inform policy in the future, or references to policy they have informed in the past in addition to any current work with policy they may be engaged in.
Appendix C: London’s CATI Indicators that a Person is Experiencing Trafficking

Some indicators

The person experiencing trafficking may:

- Be unaware of local surroundings even though they have been in the area for an extended period of time;
- Show evidence of control, intimidation or abnormal psychological fear;
- Not be able to move or leave job;
- Have tattoos that act as ‘branding’ from the trafficker;
- Be moved by trafficker, often from strip club to strip club, so that they don’t make friends;
- Won’t be allowed to hang out with friends of family;
- Have bruises or show other signs of abuse;
- Show signs of malnourishment;
- Be frequently accompanied by their trafficker;
- Speak neither English nor French, or may not speak on their own behalf;
- Originate from foreign countries, particularly China, India, Indonesia, Namibia, Thailand (top countries for labour trafficking in Canada).
Appendix D: Ontario and Provincial Coalitions Social Media Platforms

Ottawa Coalition to End Human Trafficking

Website - http://www.endhumantrafficking.ca/
Twitter - https://twitter.com/océht
Facebook - https://www.facebook.com/ottawacoalition
Instagram - https://www.instagram.com/océht_endht/

Coalition Assisting Trafficked Individuals

Website - http://catilondon.ca/
Twitter - https://twitter.com/laht
Facebook - https://www.facebook.com/London-Anti-Human-Trafficking-Committee-258424534177069/
Tumblr - https://londonantihumantrafficking.tumblr.com/

Toronto Counter Human Trafficking Network (FCJ Refugee Centre)

Website - https://torontocounterhumantraffickingnet.wordpress.com/
Twitter - https://twitter.com/refugeecentre?lang=en

York Region Anti-Human Trafficking Committee

Twitter - https://twitter.com/WSNYorkRegion
Facebook – https://m.facebook.com/infoYRAHTC/

Action Coalition on Human Trafficking

Website - http://www.actalberta.org/
Twitter - https://twitter.com/ACTAlberta
Facebook - https://www.facebook.com/ACTAlberta/
Instagram - https://www.instagram.com/actalberta/?hl=en

British Columbia’s Office to Combat Trafficking in Persons

Website - https://www2.gov.bc.ca/gov/content/justice/criminal-justice/victims-of-crime/human-trafficking/about-us

Tracia’s Trust

Website - http://www.gov.mb.ca/fs/traciatrust/
Twitter - https://twitter.com/mbgov
Facebook - https://www.facebook.com/ManitobaGovernment
Appendix E: Ontario Coalition Information Posters
1. **WHAT WE DO**

   Our Mandate

   We work to meet the acute, immediate and long-term resource and support needs of persons affected by human trafficking, including survivors, their families and communities, as well as persons who may be at risk of exploitation for the purposes of sexual exploitation, labour exploitation or organ removal / harvest.

   We also offer training for traditional service providers (such as law enforcement, health care professionals, social workers, etc.), as well as non-traditional service providers (such as the hotel and hospitality sector, the transportation sector, etc.) to educate them on the indicators of human trafficking and appropriate responses.

2. **GET INVOLVED**

   Volunteer

   Human trafficking involves the recruitment, transportation, harbouring and / or exercising control, direction or influence over the movements of a person in order to exploit that person, typically through sexual exploitation or forced labour.

   It is often described as a modern form of slavery.

3. **WHAT IS HUMAN TRAFFICKING**

4. **IT HAPPENS HERE.**

   **THIS IS WHO WE ARE**

   The Ottawa Coalition To End Human Trafficking (OCEHT) is a community-based volunteer network of local organizations, service providers and community members that represent a variety of sectors. Our work is supported through funding grants and private donations that are made to St. Joe’s Women’s Centre, and dispersed to the Coalition appropriately.

5. **DID YOU KNOW?**

   Globally, it is estimated that human trafficking is amongst the most lucrative of criminal activities, rivaled only by drug and firearms trafficking and generating billions of dollars annually for sophisticated criminal organizations.

   Contact the OCEHT easily via e-mail or through our website:
   - endhumantrafficking.ca
   - info@endhumantrafficking.ca
Most people think of human trafficking as an international problem, but you don’t need to move across borders, or even across the street, to be trafficked.

In Canada

- Canada is considered a source, transit, and destination country for men, women, and children trafficked for the purposes of prostitution and forced labour.
- The RCMP estimates that 800-1200 persons are trafficked throughout Canada annually.

How You Can Help

- Donations are payable to: London Anti-Human Trafficking Committee
- Join our committee and volunteer at our events
- If you suspect trafficking, report it
- Contact us to hold a school assembly or speaking event

Resources

MAST: www.mast-canada.com
RCMP: www.rcmp-grc.gc.ca
Human Trafficking National Coordination Centre: htncc-cncip@rcmp-grc.gc.ca
OCTIP: www.pssg.gov.bc.ca/octip
CATI: catilondon.ca

HELP LINE: (519) 438-2272

Visit us on Facebook or at our website at www.stopht.ca

London Anti-Human Trafficking Committee
e/o The Salvation Army Correctional & Justice Services
281 Wellington Street London, Ontario

Phone: (519) 432-9553 ext. 5
Fax: (519) 432-6306
Email: auraburditt@rogers.com
**Is It Human Trafficking?**

A person may be trafficked if they:
- Cannot freely change jobs
- Do not have control over their wages or money, OR do not get paid normal wages under Labour Laws of a country
- Work long hours; are not allowed statutory holidays; may live at a work site or under poor conditions
- Show signs of physical abuse or injury
- Are accompanied everywhere by someone who speaks for him/her
- Appear to be fearful of and/or under the control of another person
- May have health issues that have not been attended to
- May describe moving or changing jobs suddenly and often
- Are unfamiliar with the neighbourhood where they live or work
- Are not working in the job originally promised to them
- Lack identification such as a passport or other travel documentation
- Are forced to provide sexual services in a strip club, massage parlour, brothel, or other locations

**If you suspect: CALL CRIMESTOPPERS**
1-800-222-TIPS (8477)

---

**Human Trafficking is a Crime**

**United Nations Definition**

Human Trafficking is defined as:

The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, abduction, fraud, deception, abuse of power over one in a position of vulnerability, giving or receiving payment or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, forced prostitution or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or servitude or non-consensual removal of organs.

---

**Our Mission**

Restoring human dignity through the elimination of human trafficking in all its forms.

**Our Goals & Objectives**

PREVENTION: Education & Awareness

PROTECTION: Advocacy

PARTNERSHIPS: Collaboration

---

**What We Do**

- **PREVENTION:** We educate and raise awareness about human trafficking.
- **PROTECTION:** We advocate for respect of the human rights of every victim.
- **PARTNERSHIPS:** We collaborate with our partners for the provision of ongoing victim services and support.

"Almost 21 million people are victims of forced labour worldwide."

- The United Nations
Appendix F: BC’s OCTIP Pocket Card

BC's Office to Combat Trafficking in Persons (OCTIP)

HELP IS AVAILABLE

In British Columbia the Office to Combat Trafficking in persons is responsible for the protection and well being of trafficked persons. If you suspect someone may be exploited, or if you would like some help or support please call:

1-888-712-7974
toll free, available 24 hours, 7 days per week.

We can help arrange for a safe place to stay, medical and dental services, legal information, and emotional support.

NO ENGLISH? Tell us the language required and we will contact an interpreter immediately.

136
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Human Trafficking is a crime in Canada.</th>
<th>Sexual exploitation</th>
<th>Domestic servitude</th>
<th>Forced labour</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>When a person:</td>
<td>Trafficked persons are forced to perform sexual acts, including exotic dancing, striptease, massage, production of pornography and prostitution. Trafficked persons are often lured and groomed by people posing as boyfriends or girlfriends.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>is forced to work or provide services she or he does not want to do.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>is working for little or no pay under poor conditions.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>has lost control and access to her or his passport and personal identification documents.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>has restrictions on where and when they can go and what they can do.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Trafficked persons will work long hours, under unsafe and poor conditions for little or no pay in construction, agriculture, restaurants, or manufacturing. Trafficked persons can also be legally employed, but forced to hand over their earnings to the trafficker.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>she or he may be presumed to be a trafficked person.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>